ISSN 2233-5382 © 2023 KODISA JIDB website: http://www.jidb.or.kr doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.13106/jidb.2023.vol14.no3.27

The Structural Relationship of Sustainable Organizational Commitment of Beauty Industry Employees in the 4th Industrial Revolution Era

Eun-Jung SHIN¹, Ki-Han KWON²

Received: January 18, 2023. Revised: March 16, 2023. Accepted: March 25, 2023.

Abstract

Purpose: Changes in the employment environment in the era of the 4th Industrial Revolution are influencing various factors by the emergence of new jobs and the change in perception of job stability due to globalization of information technology and industry This study attempted to present implications by verifying the structural relationship of beauty workers' sustainable organizational commitment and the method necessary for conflict management in the industrial field due to the recent changes in the employment environment of the beauty industry in the 4th Industrial Revolution. **Research design, data and methodology:** This study sampled 604 beauty industry employees Frequency analysis, validity and reliability analysis, factor analysis, and path analysis were performed using SPSS WIN23.0. **Results:** It was found that the change in the employment environment of beauty industry workers. **Conclusion:** This study is that changes in the employment environment negatively affect job satisfaction and organizational commitment of beauty workers. We hope to contribute to the development and growth of the beauty industry by providing basic data for the beauty tech service industry in the 4th industrial era.

Keywords: Beauty Industry Employees, Beauty Industry, Organizational Commitment, 4th Industrial Revolution, Sustainable, employment environment

JEL Classification Code : J21, J24, J28, J63, O14

1. Introduction

Intelligent Information Technologies, which lead the 4th Industrial Revolution, predict that human labor can be replaced and efficiently achieved in that they can judge themselves, present solutions for problem solving, and handle them autonomously (Pfeffer & Baron, 1988; Atchison,1991; Robinson et al.,1994; Brockne et al.,1992;

Kim,1999) Employees in the beauty industry influence the management and evaluation of service (Jeong & Baek, 2012). It is predicted that the possibility of relying on technology will increase even in the creative field, which was classified as a human domain (Eom & Lee, 2020). Concerns about the impact on the labor market coexist in the sense that artificial intelligence-related technologies may ultimately replace human labor as they develop

© Copyright: The Author(s)

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (http://Creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) which permits unrestricted noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

First Author. Ph.D. Candidate, Department of Beauty Arts Care, Dongguk University, Korea. Email: choishin0732@naver.com

² Corresponding Author, Professor, College of General Education, Kookmin University, Korea, Email: kihan.kwon@kookmin.ac.kr

(Caruso, 2018; DeCanio, 2016; Furman & Seamans, 2019; Huang & Rust, 2018). The Future of Jobs, published by the Davos Forum, predicts that the fourth industrial revolution will result in the loss of about 7.1 million jobs in the future and the emergence of about 2.1 million new jobs, resulting in the loss of about 5 million jobs. (Teagarden, 2020). The 4th industrial revolution is a technological innovation achieved through the convergence of information and communication technologies (ICT: Information Communication Technology). It refers to a global trend that breaks down the boundaries between digital technology and physical and biological existence and creates innovative changes across new technologies, economies, industries, and cultures.

Due to the influence of the 4th Industrial Revolution, simple labor jobs are in an employment crisis due to artificial intelligence or robots, while expectations are growing that artificial intelligence or robots will still produce human-specific results that cannot be replaced in occupations that require expertise and creativity. Whether or not it is a job that can be replaced by a robot will eventually be determined by whether human creativity, empathy, communication. emotion, and human relationships work. Countries and companies exposed to changes in the labor paradigm following the destructive innovations of the 4th Industrial Revolution are struggling to prepare countermeasures for changes in work content and job reduction. Germany has been vigorously pushing ahead with the 'Labor (Arbeit) 4.0' project since 2015 at the government level to respond to concerns and opposition from labor circles who suspect the implementation of 'Industry 4.0' as destroying jobs (Kim, 2018).

The solution proposed by Germany's Labor 4.0 is to secure time sovereignty and space sovereignty to workers through work-life balance. Even in the core job competencies required of workers, considering the mutual compatibility with the cyber-physical system of coordination and decision-making and collaboration and coordination, the importance of communication and cognitive competencies will increase (Lee, 2018). The reason why conflicting claims about the 4th Industrial Revolution and jobs exist seems to be due to different views on human unmet needs. Fundamentally, when there are unmet human needs, jobs are created (Ahn & Lee, 2016).

2. Literature Review

2.1. Changes in the Employment Environment in the Era of the 4th Industrial Revolution

Germany's Industry 4.0 presented the topic of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, and three people, Henning Kagermann, Wolfgang Wahlster, and WolfDieter Lucas, advocated the German manufacturing innovation strategy to borrow the results of technological innovation from the perspective of industrial innovation in German The 4th Industrial Revolution is not a manufacturing. technological innovation strategy, but an industrial innovation strategy. Technological innovation is a means or tool for industrial innovation, not an end in itself (Lee, 2017). Existing discussions related to employment relations said that the employment relationship formed within the organization was important It is emphasized that the specific mix of employment relationships will positively affect the various outcomes of an organization. However, changes in the employment relationship that will result from technological change have not been well discussed (Kang, 2007; Lee, 2018).

When rapid technological changes such as the era of the 4th Industrial Revolution arrive, it is inevitable to induce a rapid change in employment relations. This can cause conflict between labor (Lepak & Snell, 1999). It would also be meaningful to identify the employment relationship and its changes that will emerge due to the technological change of the 4th Industrial Revolution. Here, 'Employment Relationship' can be defined as a series of ties formed between individual workers and organizations based on mutual rights and obligations. This is not just a form of employment, but a concept that encompasses structural, cognitive, and emotional solidarity formed between workers and organizations (Tsui et al., 1997).

With new technological innovations, humans have created new jobs that require new capabilities. In the long run, the employment rate has remained fairly stable and has never disappeared. However, it may take some time to acquire expertise in new jobs (Kim et al., 2016). The more complex and uncertain the business environment is, the more appropriate a response is needed to maintain and develop the organization. Otherwise, they cannot preempt the competitive advantage. The cosmetics service industry is a labor-intensive industry, and it is said that the stable working environment of workers is also important to provide the best quality of service for customers (Lee & Won, 2017; Jeong & Baek, 2012). Research on the perception and attitude of employees and workers in the beauty industry according to changes in the employment environment in the era of the 4th Industrial Revolution requires theoretical and practical (Meyer et al., 1991).

2.2. Continuous Organizational Commitment Recognition of Job Insecurity among Beauty Industry

Organizational commitment means that an individual wants to remain in the organization by being attached to the organization and is committed to the organization. It means the willingness to accept the values and goals of the organization and the degree of acceptance (Williams & Anderson, 1991; Allen & Meyer, 1990).

It was defined as an attitude in which members of an organization accept the goals and values of the organization, give their allegiance to the organization, and continue to remain as members of the organization (Meyer et al., 1991). It was said that organizational commitment in the behavioral dimension can be used to evaluate the tendency of employees. Organizational survival commitment is defined as an individual accepting the organization's values and goals and feeling part of it (Utami et al., 2021). Organizational commitment (OC) was intensively analyzed to improve organizational performance based on the OC of members from the perspective of organizational behavior (Allen & Meyer, 1990). Organizational commitment (OC) refers to the desire of members to strive for the organization and achieve their goals (Cotton & Tuttle, 1986)

2.3. Turnover Intention of Beauty Industry Workers in the Beauty Iindustry

Unlike other services, the beauty service industry is a natural science and engineering based on artistry. The beauty service industry is a convergence of social sciences that provide services, and it is an industry with great potential to create new demand (Jung, 2017). The scope of the beauty industry includes the beauty manufacturing industry, which manufactures and distributes cosmetics, beauty supplies, and beauty devices, and the beauty service industry, which provides beauty-related services using hair, skin (esthetic), nails, and makeup. Related industries can include tourism, fashion, food, medical, etc. in terms of providing fundamental beauty Beauty workers must have professional skills in beauty, creativity in design direction, and a service spirit with character at the center. Good beauty workers should be able to be achieved by service training and technology (Sandhva & Sulphey, 2020). Turnover intention can be defined as the prevailing mental decision between an individual's approach to work to continue or quit (Sandhya & Sulphey, 2020).

Turnover includes both accession and separation of organizational members. Also referred to as labor transfer, turnover in the narrow sense refers to the termination of membership in an organization by an individual who receives monetary compensation from the organization and leaves the organization Turnover was defined as including resignation, employment, dismissal, temporary dismissal, military service, physical abnormality, retirement age, death, and turnover due to new recruitment and re-employment (Bluedorn & Allen, 1982). The higher the satisfaction with human relations, working environment, and education, the lower the turnover intention did (Kwak & Song, 2014). Turnover intentions may not actually lead directly to turnover, but these turnover intentions themselves can have an indirect effect on individuals and organizations (GUZZO & Richard, 1994). Turnover intention is a factor that predicts turnover, and if turnover intention is actually implemented into action, the company will receive a cost loss for turnover. Along with organizational efficiency, it negatively affects the atmosphere of the organization (Mor Barak et al., 2001). Among the important issues of sustainable management Human Resource Management (HRM) is a way to reduce turnover (Boine & Kim, 2018). Turnover intention is a very sensitive issue from the perspective of the organization because it pays for career development of workers by recruiting new workers (Ehrhardt et al., 2011).

It was said that interpersonal factors were the factors that had the greatest influence on turnover intention in the hair beauty industry Compensatory dimensions such as promotion and wages are needed to lower actual turnover through the management of turnover intention. It can be expressed differently for each individual, such as the working environment such as welfare benefits, working hours, working conditions improvement plans, and personal tendencies. Access is required from various perspectives such as job attitude and job satisfaction. In terms of human resource management of an organization, an approach to increase efficiency is required.

3. Research Methods and Materials

3.1. Research Models and Hypotheses

It represents the research model of this study. The research hypothesis is reflected in the research model by examining the causal relationship related to organizational commitment according to changes in the employment environment based on the previous



Figure 1: Research Model

3.2. Composition of Measurement Tools

The questionnaire questions used as measurement tools of this study were largely composed of 67 questions of demographic characteristics, change in the employment environment, recognition of job instability, organizational commitment, turnover intention, and work experience. The detailed configuration is as follows. Changes in organizational structure, increase in non-regular workers, and generalization of layoffs, which are factors of changes in the employment environment, are 5 questions each, totaling 15 questions.

The possibility of job loss, which is a factor in the perception of job instability, 4 questions. A sense of helplessness, five questions Wage instability is a total of 13 questions, 4 questions each. Conscientious behavior, altruism, and self-realization, which are job satisfaction factors, are 15 questions, 5 questions each. The organizational commitment factors, such as continuous commitment, emotional commitment, normative commitment, and turnover intention, consisted of 10 questions. Demographic characteristics (gender, age, educational background, marriage, income) consisted of 5 questions and working characteristics were 9 questions.

3.3. Data Collection and Analysis

Data collection and analysis in this study were

distributed, 620 copies were collected, and 604 copies were used as final analysis data, excluding 16 copies with insincere responses. Statistical processing of the data collected by the data analysis method was analyzed using SPSS (Statistical Package for Social Science) WIN23.0 statistical package program through data coding and data cleaning process. First, frequency analysis was performed to identify the general characteristics of the sample. Second, to analyze the validity and reliability of the measurement tool, the validity of the factors composed of each variable was verified.

To understand the structure of factors, we performed an exploratory factor analysis, which is one of the multivariate statistical techniques, followed by a reliability analysis. Feasibility indicators were confirmed through exploratory factor analysis. As an analysis method to simplify the contents, numerous variables were grouped with highly correlated variables to see if variables measuring the same concept were grouped into the same factor. In particular, the number of factors was reduced, and information loss was minimized through the Principal Components Analysis method.

In addition, factor rotation was used to ensure mutual independence between factors. The Varimax method, a right-angle rotation method that maintains the angle between the axes of each factor at 90°, was used. Through reliability analysis, it was verified whether the concepts to be measured for the measurement items classified by analysis result factors were consistently and accurately measured through the responses of the survey respondents. The internal consistency of the measurement items through Cronbach's Alpha was investigated. In this study, it was tested under the significance level p < 0.05, p < 0.01, and p < 0.001.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1. Demographic Characteristics of the Sample

For the empirical survey of this study, a survey was conducted focusing on workers in the beauty industry, focusing on Seoul and Gyeonggi-do, which are close to the metropolitan area, in consideration of the effectiveness and convenience of the survey. The results of frequency analysis conducted to find out the demographic characteristics of the survey subjects in this study are as follows shown as a Table 1.

variable	Sortation	Frequency (Number)	Percentage (%)
the en	tire	604	100.0
	Franchise 30~40	61	10.1
Shon size	Franchise 20~30	58	9.6
	Private shop 20~30	354	58.6
	Private shop 10~20	131	21.7
	5people or less	310	51.3
Number of employees	6~10people or less	172	28.5
Number of employees	11~15people or less	72	11.9
	More than 16 people	50	8.3
	an apartment complex	306	50.7
	a busy street	191	31.6
Shop location	Shopping mall, department store	15	2.5
	etc	92	15.2
	less than 1 year	112	18.5
	Less than 1 to 5 years	133	22.0
Working period	less than 5 to 10 years	107	17.7
	Less than 10-15 years	87	14.4
	for more than 15 years	165	27.3
	Intern	43	7.1
	Beginner designer	85	14.1
position	Designer	152	25.2
	Manager	105	17.4
	director	219	36.3
	Less than 8 hours	219	36.3
Working hours	Less than 8-10 hours	300	49.7
	Less than 10 to 12 hours	53	8.8
	More than 12 hours	32	5.3
	less than four times	178	29.5
	5 times	115	19.0
Holiday	6 times	37	6.1
	7 times	33	5.5
	more than eight times	241	39.9
	a monthly salary system	99	16.4
Salary	Basic salary + incentive	79	13.1
	100% incentive	156	25.8
	an hourly wage system	43	7.1

Table 1: Characteristics of the Subject to Investigation (N=604)

	director	227	37.6
	Hair	365	60.4
	Skin	136	22.5
the field of business	Nail	39	6.5
	Make up	10	1.7
	Cosmetic	54	8.9
gender	man	73	12.1
	Woman	531	87.9
	19 years old or younger	6	1.0
	20 years old or older - under 30 years old	147	24.3
age	30 years old or older - under 40 years old	107	17.7
	Over 40 - under 50	224	37.1
	50 years of age or older	120	19.9
	less than high school	202	33.4
one's final educational background.	College enrollment/graduation	165	27.3
	University enrollment/graduation	119	19.7
	Graduate school or higher	118	19.5
	single	277	45.9
the state of marriage	married	285	47.2
	Others (divorce, widowed, separated, etc.)	42	7.0
	less than 1 million won	8	1.3
	More than 100 million won - less than 200 million won	72	11.9
average monthly income	More than 2 million won and less than 3 million won	228	37.7
	More than 300 million won - 400 million won	196	32.5
	over 400 million won	100	16.6

The size of the shop was found to be between 20 and 30, 354 people (58.65%) at private shops, between 10 and 20, 131 people (21.7%), between 30 and 40, 61 people (10.1%) at franchises, and between 20 and 30, 58 people (9.6%). The number of employees was 310 (51.3%) with less than 5 employees, 172 (28.5%) with less than 6-10 employees, 72 (11.9%) with less than 11-15 employees, and 50 (8.3%) with more than 16 employees.

As for shop locations, 306 people (50.7%) in apartment complexes and residential areas, 191 people (31.6%) in downtown areas, 92 people (15.2%) in others, and 15 people (2.5%) in shopping malls and department stores. The working period was 165 (27.3%) for more than 15 years, 133 (22.0%) for less than 1 to 5 years, 112 (18.5%) for less than 1 year, 107 (17.7%) for less than 5 to 10 years, and 87 (14.4%) for less than 10 to 15 years. The positions

were 219 directors (36.3%), 152 designers (25.2%), 105 managers, managers (17.4%), 85 beginner designers (14.1%), and 43 interns (7.1%). Working hours were 300 (49.7%) with less than 8 to 10 hours, 219 (36.3%) with less than 8 hours, 53 (8.8%) with less than 10 to 12 hours, and 32 (5.3%) with more than 12 hours. The number of holidays was 241 (39.9%) more than eight times, 178 (29.5%) less than four times, 115 (19.0%) in five times, 37 (6.1%) in six times, and 33 (5.5%) in seven times. The salary was 227 directors (37.6%), 156 people (25.8%) in 100% incentives, 99 people (16.4%) in salary system, 79 people (13.1%) in basic salary + incentives, and 43 people (7.1%) in hourly wage system. In the field of work, 365 hair (60.4%), 136 skin (22.5%), 54 fragrance (8.9%), 39 nail (6.5%) and 10 makeup (1.7%) were found. The gender was 531 women (87.9%) and 73 men (12.1%). The age was 224 (37.1%) under the age of 40 to 50, 147 (24.3%)

under the age of 20 to 30, 120 (19.9%) over the age of 50, 107 (17.7%) under the age of 30 to 40, and 6 (1.0%) under the age of 19. The educational background was 202 high school graduates (33.4%), 165 graduates (27.3%), 119 graduates (19.7%), and 118 graduates (19.5%) above graduate school. Marriage was 285 married (47.2%), 277 unmarried (45.9%), and 42 others (divorced, separated, separated) (7.0%). Monthly income was 228 (37.7%) less than 2 to 3 million won, 196 (32.5%) less than 3 to 4 million won, 100 (16.6%) more than 4 million won, 72 (11.9%) less than 1 to 2 million won, and 8 (1.3%) less than 1 million won shown as a Table 1.

4.2. Reliability and Feasibility Analysis

4.2.1. Reliability and Validity of the Employment Environment Change, Job Satisfaction, Recognition ofJjob Insecurity, Organizational Commitment, and Turnover Intention Scale

Items with low reliability were excluded from the analysis, and a method using the Cronbach's alpha (C α) coefficient is intended to measure internal consistency. The Cronbach's alpha (C α) coefficient is generally 0.7 or

more to ensure that the measured value is reliable. As a result of analyzing the reliability of the measurement items, Cronbach's α coefficient for organizational structure change was 0.933, The Cronbach's α coefficient for the increase in non-regular workers was 0.843, the Cronbach's α coefficient for the universalization of layoffs was 0.854, and the Cronbach's Cronbach's a coefficient for conscientious behavior was 0.923. Cronbach's a coefficient for altruism is 0.904, Cronbach's a coefficient for self-realization is 0.835 and Cronbach's α coefficient for job loss possibility is 0.930. The α coefficient of helplessness Cronbach is 0.888, the α coefficient of wage instability Cronbach is 0.863, and the α coefficient of continuous immersion Cronbach is 0.880. Emotional immersion Cronbach's α coefficient is 0.960, normative immersion Cronbach's a coefficient is 0.885. The Cronbach's α coefficient of turnover intention was 0.980, higher than the general standard of 0.7. Therefore, the reliability, which is the internal consistency of the entire response, was identified as an appropriate level shown as

Table2: Reliability and Validity of the Employment Environment Change, Job Satisfaction, Recognition of job Insecurity, Organizational Commitment, and Turnover Intention Scale

	,	Cronbach' α,	Standardized Croubach' α	G6(smc)	Mean correlation coefficient	
	Organizational structure – restructuring 1					
Change in organizational structure	Organizational structure – eduction of work 2					
	Organizational structure – Business relationship 3	0.933	0.933	0.927	0.737	
	Organizational structure – Technology replacement4					
	Organizational structure – Business integration5					
	Non-regular worker – Temporary job1		0.844			
	Non-regular worker – contract worker 2					
an increase in non-regular workers	Non-regular worker – Full-time employee 3	0.843		0.813	0.519	
WOIKEIS	Non-regular worker – dispatched 4					
	Non-regular worker – Part-time 5					
	Layoffs - Additional dismissal 1				0.538	
Generalization of redundancy	Layoffs – Honorary retirement 2	0.854	0.853	0.863		
	Layoffs – Dismissal Execution 3					

	Layoffs – Workforce reduction 4					
	Layoffs – New inhibition 5					
	Conscientious behavior - Procedure Compliance 1					
	Conscientious behavior - Compliance with rules 2					
conscientious behavior	Conscientious behavior - Getting off work 3	0.923	0.923	0.912	0.705	
	Conscientious behavior-					
	Conscientious behavior - Commodity saving 5					
	altruism - Counseling 1					
	altruism - colleague help 2					
	altruism - Relationship			0.901		
altruism	maintenance 3	0.904	0.903		0.650	
	altruism- Respect for colleagues 4					
	altruism - Company Adaptation 5					
Self-realization	self-actualization - Business					
	Interest 1					
	growth 2					
	self-actualization - Job Reward 3	0.835	0.835	0.810	0.502	
	self-actualization - Career Help 4					
	self-actualization - Future Growth 5					
	Loss of duty – Possible dismissal 1					
Possibility of job	Unclear Future 2	0.020	0.021	0.022	0.771	
loss	Loss of duty –	0.930	0.931	0.935	0.771	
	autonomy reduction3					
	Loss of duty – Promotion reduction 4					
	helplessness –					
	helplessnes –					
	Desperation 2					
Helplessness	helplessness – Irritable 3	0.888	0.888	0.868	0.612	
	helplessness –					
	Tiredness 4					
	Drinking and smoking 5					
	Wage instability –					
Wage Instability	Salary level 1	0.863	0.863	0.833	0.611	
	vvage instability–					

	Salary reduction 2				
	Wage instability – Salary difficulty 3				
	Wage instability- Wage instability 4				
	Continuous immersion – Organization Required 1				
	Organizational damage 2				
Continuous immersion	Continuous immersion – Select Organization 3	0.880	0.879	0.866	0.592
	Continuous immersion – Unable to quit 4				
	Continuous immersion - Considerations 5				
emotional immersion	Emotional immersion – Organizational Meaning 1				
	Emotional immersion – Organization: 2				
	Emotional immersion – Organization happiness 3	0.960	0.960	0.953	0.828
	Emotional immersion – Organizational Positive 4				
	Emotional immersion – Organization problem 5				
	Normative commitment - Organizational loyalty 1		0.885		
	Normative commitment - Organizational value 2			0.873	0.606
normative commitment	Normative commitment - Organizational ethics 3	0.885			
	Normative commitment – Management policy 4				
	Normative commitment – Conditional Party 5				
	conditional turnover				
	Worrying about leaving the company				
	difficulty in changing jobs	-			
	Regret of participation				
turnover intention	immediate regret	0.980	0.980	0.981	0.834
	uncertainty of employment				
	No retirement age	1			
L V D	Job turnover recruitment				
	Worrying about leaving the company				
	a turnover intention				

4.3. Factor Analysis: Rotated Component Matrix (KMO and Barrett)

Employment Environment for Independent Variables

The results of factor analysis on changes in the employment environment for confirmatory independent variables are as follows. A total of three factors were

4.3.1. Factor Analysis Results for Changes in the

derived, and the total cumulative explanatory power was

68.442%. KMO was 0.856 and Bartlett's test was χ^2 =5875.635, which was identified as a significant model (p<0.05). Factor 1 showed an eigenvalue of 3.971, and the explanatory power was found to be 26.475%. Factor 2

showed an eigenvalue of 3.192, and the explanatory power was found to be 21.280%. Factor 3 showed an eigenvalue of 3.103, and the explanatory power was identified as 20.687% shown as a Table 3.

Table3: Factor Analysis on Changes in the E	Employment Environment for Independent Variables

		rivio anu	Dartiett 5 Test			
КМО				0.856		
	X ²			5875.635		
	degre	e of freedom		105.0		
Bartlett's sphericity test	t Signif	icance Probability		0.000		
variable	factor 1	factor 2	factor 3	commonality		
restructuring	0.939	0.180	0.092	0.923		
business reduction	0.876	0.122	0.029	0.784		
Business integration	0.864	0.137	0.105	0.777		
Business relationship	0.857	0.089	0.036	0.744		
Human resource replacement	0.835	0.158	0.113	0.734		
staff reduction	0.119	0.905	0.107	0.845		
restructuring	0.108	0.868	0.105	0.777		
voluntary retirement	0.048	0.718	0.155	0.542		
Recruitment inhibition	0.140	0.685	0.080	0.495		
Additional layoffs	0.256	0.676	0.181	0.555		
contract worker	0.121	0.067	0.819	0.689		
a dispatched position	0.048	0.139	0.790	0.645		
part-time work	0.009	0.126	0.762	0.597		
a makeshift job	0.072	0.088	0.756	0.584		
permanent employee	0.089	0.173	0.732	0.574		
an eigenvalue	3.971	3.192	3.103			
explanatory power	0.265	0.213	0.207			
Cumulative explanatory power	0.265	0.478	0.684			

* p<0.05 ** p<0.01 *** p<0.001

4.3.2. Results of Factor Analysis on Job Satisfaction, Job Instability, and Job Commitment

The results of factor analysis for factor analysis on corroborative parameters job satisfaction, job instability, and job commitment are as follows. A total of 9 factors were derived, and the total cumulative explanatory power was about 74.215%. KMO was 0.868 and Bartlett's test was identified as a significant model with $\chi^2=22149.471$ (p<0.05). Factor 1 showed an eigenvalue of 4.538, and its explanatory power was found to be 10.554%. Factor 2 showed an eigenvalue of 3.879, and its explanatory power was found to be 9.022%. Factor 3 showed an eigenvalue of 3.686, and its explanatory power was found to be

8.572%. Factor 4 showed an eigenvalue of 3.642, and its explanatory power was found to be 8.469%. Factor 5 showed an eigenvalue of 3.486, and its explanatory power was found to be 8.106%. Factor 6 showed an eigenvalue of 3.415, and its explanatory power was found to be 7.941%. Factor 7 showed an eigenvalue of 3.409, and its explanatory power was found to be 7.928%. Factor 8 showed an eigenvalue of 3.103, and the explanatory power was identified as 7.216%. Factor 9 showed an eigenvalue of 2.755, and the explanatory power was identified as 6.407% shown as a Table 4.

36

KMO and Bartlett's Test												
KMO 0.868												
	x ² 22149.471											
			(degree of fi	reedom						903.0	
Bartlett's spher	icity test			Significance	e Probabi	lity		0.000				
variable	factor 1	factor 2	factor 3	factor 4	factor 5	factor 6	facto	or 7	factor 8	factor 9	commonality	
organization affiliation	0.931	0.074	-0.036	0.049	-0.045	0.128	0.1	108	0.060	-0.093	0.918	
organization positive	0.906	0.056	-0.052	0.076	-0.025	0.142	0.1	133	0.079	-0.063	0.882	
organizational meaning	0.898	0.090	-0.020	0.030	-0.065	0.149	0.1	138	0.062	-0.038	0.867	
self- responsibility	0.894	0.048	-0.034	0.053	0.001	0.168	0.1	142	0.056	-0.061	0.861	
organizational happiness	0.855	0.043	0.054	-0.027	-0.091	0.122	0.1	112	0.059	-0.052	0.778	
Compliance with procedures	0.035	0.872	-0.022	0.220	-0.030	0.067	0.1	111	0.075	-0.023	0.834	
faithfulness	0.043	0.848	-0.034	0.238	-0.063	0.059	0.1	146	0.082	-0.035	0.816	
work hours	0.033	0.835	-0.090	0.237	-0.040	0.011	0.0)81	0.041	-0.021	0.772	
Spare goods	0.125	0.833	-0.038	0.107	-0.058	0.127	0.0	004	0.096	-0.002	0.752	
Compliance with rules	0.069	0.804	-0.013	0.145	-0.040	0.038	0.0)44	0.112	0.018	0.690	
future uncertain	-0.023	-0.032	0.911	-0.068	0.260	-0.087	-0.	103	-0.070	0.163	0.953	
can be fired	-0.029	-0.035	0.899	-0.045	0.239	-0.065	-0.	099	-0.061	0.153	0.911	
Free Collapse	-0.010	-0.054	0.896	-0.026	0.188	-0.064	-0.	084	-0.074	0.142	0.878	
promotion reduction	-0.011	-0.094	0.579	-0.170	0.419	-0.077	-0.	075	0.014	0.257	0.627	
trouble counseling	-0.019	0.198	-0.060	0.892	-0.045	0.029	0.0	090	0.187	-0.026	0.886	
Respect for colleagues	-0.017	0.193	-0.023	0.885	-0.069	0.040	0.1	120	0.180	-0.064	0.878	
maintain relationship	0.012	0.197	-0.122	2 0.858	-0.038	0.018	0.0	086	0.172	-0.045	0.832	
colleague work	0.072	0.169	0.025	0.665	-0.091	0.002	0.0	019	0.212	-0.003	0.530	
colleague help	0.150	0.240	-0.083	0.055	-0.035	0.084	-0.	083	0.172	-0.044	0.505	
increased drinking	-0.095	-0.002	0.073	-0.011	0.802	-0.007	-0.	054	-0.043	0.221	0.788	
annoyance	-0.051	-0.064	0.180	-0.044	0.776	0.067	-0.	140	-0.035	0.245	0.728	
tired	-0.035	-0.080	0.349	-0.173	0.702	-0.086	-0.	032	0.019	0.126	0.677	
desperation	-0.057	-0.044	0.519	-0.025	0.624	-0.047	-0.	117	-0.056	0.137	0.701	
Considerations	0.220	0.056	-0.096	0.067	0.026	0.818	0.1	159	0.034	-0.016	0.761	
Difficulty leaving	0.152	0.096	-0.080	0.051	0.024	0.798	0.2	234	0.031	0.011	0.735	
voluntary work	0.132	0.047	-0.017	0.034	-0.059	0.759	0.3	300	0.055	0.023	0.695	
no choice	0.006	0.012	-0.004	-0.037	-0.161	0.751	0.1	162	0.063	-0.034	0.623	
Worrying about leaving the company	0.285	0.107	-0.083	0.058	0.048	0.730	0.1	144	0.008	-0.086	0.667	
management	0.132	0.074	-0.084	0.072	-0.060	0.206	0.8	341	0.043	-0.070	0.795	

Table4: Factor Analysis of Parameters Job Satisfaction, Job Instability, and Job Commitment.

policy										
conditional turnover	0.215	0.081	-0.143	0.059	-0.019	0.190	0.810	-0.014	-0.052	0.772
turnover unethical	0.020	0.069	-0.008	-0.002	-0.118	0.222	0.786	0.038	-0.023	0.688
organizational loyalty	0.134	0.098	-0.067	0.044	-0.134	0.256	0.777	0.046	-0.045	0.725
organizational value	0.372	0.084	-0.131	0.094	-0.032	0.183	0.578	-0.004	-0.141	0.560
work interest	0.008	0.069	-0.066	0.192	0.013	0.026	0.075	0.808	-0.022	0.706
Business reward	0.075	0.054	0.004	0.174	0.034	0.035	0.063	0.755	-0.053	0.618
work help	0.007	0.032	-0.068	0.180	-0.054	-0.035	0.024	0.749	-0.041	0.605
Business growth	0.108	0.160	-0.064	0.066	-0.049	0.143	-0.041	0.722	-0.021	0.593
Recognition of growth	0.067	0.058	0.000	0.149	-0.061	0.013	-0.017	0.715	-0.069	0.551
salary difficulties	-0.103	-0.010	0.135	-0.019	0.236	0.012	-0.077	-0.073	0.857	0.830
salary level	-0.105	0.050	0.057	0.002	0.248	-0.041	-0.076	-0.092	0.802	0.737
wage insecurity	-0.056	-0.057	0.242	-0.133	0.223	-0.045	-0.020	-0.019	0.740	0.683
Salary reduction	-0.072	-0.053	0.474	-0.025	0.132	-0.029	-0.124	-0.079	0.672	0.725
an eigenvalue	4.538	3.879	3.686	3.642	3.486	3.415	3.409	3.103	2.755	
explanatory power	0.106	0.090	0.086	0.085	0.081	0.079	0.079	0.072	0.064	
Cumulative explanatory power	0.106	0.196	0.281	0.366	0.447	0.527	0.606	0.678	0.742	

Table5: Result of Factor Analysis on the Dependent Variable Turnover Intention

KMO and Bartlett's Test								
КМО		0.971						
	X ²	9499.964						
	degree of freedom	45.0						
Bartlett's sphericity test								
	Significance Probability	0.000						
variable	factor 1	commonality						
immediate regret	0.972	0.945						
Worrying about leaving the company	0.965	0.931						
conditional turnover	0.954	0.911						
uncertainty about the future	0.950	0.903						
difficulty in changing jobs	0.947	0.896						
No retirement age	0.916	0.839						
Regret of participation	0.914	0.835						
a turnover intention	0.899	0.808						
Worrying about leaving the company	0.856	0.733						
Job turnover recruitment	0.848	0.718						
an eigenvalue	8.519							
explanatory power	0.852							
Cumulative explanatory power	0.852							

4.3.3. Result of Factor Analysis on the Dependent Variable Turnover Intention

The results of the factor analysis on the confirmatory dependent variable turnover intention are as follows. A total of one factor was derived, and the total cumulative explanatory power was about 85.190%. KMO was 0.971 and Bartlett's test was χ^2 =9499.964, which was identified as a significant model (p<0.05). Factor 1 showed an eigenvalue of 8.519, and the explanatory power was identified as 85.190%. shown as a Table 5

4.4. Model Fit Analysis

In general, the standard model fit analysis of the overall fit of path analysis is as follows. If the significance probability is greater than or equal to 0.05, the null hypothesis is adopted, and the model is suitable for the

data of the population. Goodness Fitness Index (GFI) adjusted goodness of fit index (AGFI), Root Mean Residua (RMR), and NFI (Normed Fitness Index) Finally, TLI (Tucker-Lewis Index) that can compare the proposed model and the basic model should be obtained. In this study, the fit of the model was evaluated using chi-square, GFI, AGFI, NFI, TLI, RMR, and Root Mean Square of Error Approximation (RMSEA). GFI, AGFI, NFI, and TLI are rated as good models if they are 0.8 to 0.9 or higher, and RMR and RMSEA=0.08 or less. Based on this, the suitability of the structural equation model presented in this study was evaluated. As a result of the analysis, X2184.080 (df=1, p=0.000) and GFI were 0.896, AGFI -0.554, NFI 0.778, TLI -1.238, CFI 0.776, RMR 0.025, and RMSEA 0.551, and the suitability level of the model was found to be good. shown as a Table 6

Table6: Analysis of the Path of Change in the Employment Environment, Job Satisfaction, Job Instability, Organizational Commitment, and Turnover Intention

Model fit index	x2(CHi- square)	degrees of freedom (Df)	p-value	Q	GFI	AGFI	NFI	TLI(NNFI)	CFI	RMR	RMSEA
Research model	184.080	1	0.000***	184.080	0.896	-0.554	0.778	-1.238	0.776	0.025	0.551

* p<0.05 ** p<0.01 *** p<0.001

4.5. Research Hypothesis Test (Results of Variable Influence Relationship Analysis)

The results of verifying the hypothesis of the study on the structural influence relationship between job environment change and job satisfaction, job instability, organizational commitment, and path analysis of turnover intention are as follows. The path of the effect of changes in the employment environment on job satisfaction was found to have a significant negative (-) effect with a standardized coefficient (β =-0.440) and t-value -12.058 (p<0.05). The path of the effect of changes in the employment environment on job insecurity was found to have a significant positive (+) effect with a standardized coefficient (β = 0.551) and t-value of 16.210 (p<0.05). Figure 2 and Table 7 show the effect of changes in the employment environment on organizational commitment.

Table7. Analysis of the Path of Change in the Employment Environment, Job Satisfaction, Job Instability, Organizational Commitment, and Turnover Intention

			standardization factor	unnormalized coefficient	SE	t-value	p-value
Job Satisfaction	<-	Employment Environment Change	-0.440	-0.460	0.038	-12.058	0.000***
Job Instability	<-	Employment Environment Change	0.551	0.797	0.049	16.210	0.000***
Organizational Commitment	<-	Employment Environment Change	-0.225	-0.256	0.055	-4.624	0.000***
	<-	Job Satisfaction	0.141	0.154	0.046	3.367	0.001**

	<-	Job Instability	-0.123	-0.097	0.035	-2.732	0.006**
Turnover Intention	<'	Job Satisfaction	-0.306	-0.626	0.075	-8.400	0.000***
	<'	Job Instability	0.240	0.354	0.054	6.554	0.000***
	<-	Organizational Commitment	-0.187	-0.349	0.069	-5.060	0.000***

^{*} p<0.05 ** p<0.01 *** p<0.001



Figure 2. Study result model. (Note. *p < 0.05, ** p <0.01, *** p < 0.001)

4.6. Study Hypothesis Test Results and Discussion

The path of the effect of changes in the employment environment on job satisfaction was found to have a significant negative (-) effect with a standardized coefficient (β =-0.440) and t-value -12.058 (p<0.05). The path of the effect of changes in the employment environment on job insecurity was found to have a significant positive (+) effect with a standardized coefficient (β = 0.551) and t-value of 16.210 (p<0.05). The path of the effect of changes in the employment environment on organizational commitment was found to have a significant negative (-) effect with a standardized coefficient (β =-0.225) and t-value -4.624 (p<0.05). The path of the effect of job satisfaction on organizational commitment was found to have a significant positive (+) effect with a standardized coefficient (β = 0.141) and have a significant negative (-) effect with a standardized coefficient (β =-0.123) and t-value -2.732 (p<0.05). The path of the effect of job satisfaction on turnover intention was found to have a significant negative (-) effect with a standardized coefficient (β =-0.306) and t-value -8.400 (p < 0.05). The path of the effect of job insecurity on value of 3.367 (p<0.05). The path of the effect of job instability on organizational commitment was found to turnover intention was found to have a significant positive (+) effect with a standardized coefficient ($\beta = 0.240$) and t-value of 6.554 (p<0.05). The path of the effect of organizational commitment on turnover intention was found to have a significant negative (-) effect with a standardized coefficient (β =-0.187) and t-value -5.060 (p<0.05). This study empirically analyzed the structural relationship between employment change, job satisfaction, job instability, organizational commitment, and turnover intention. The findings provided evidence for the

40

hypotheses proposed, but some were not supported.

This study obtained the following results. First, because of analyzing the structural model, it was found that job satisfaction due to changes in the employment environment had a positive effect on organizational commitment. Accordingly, organizational procedures have been established so that members can work passionately, trust, and devote themselves to the organization. Second, job instability was found to have a negative (-) effect on organizational commitment. Third, it was found that organizational commitment had a negative (-) effect on turnover intention. It was analyzed that even if there is a change in the public environment, if an environment where people can immerse themselves in the organization and job is created, it does not affect the turnover. This increased organizational trust and organizational commitment, leading to high organizational performance by indirectly supporting employees to perform their tasks passionately. Based on these results, the relationship between the variables proposed in this paper forms job satisfaction and organizational commitment, ultimately leading to high performance. In addition, this study confirmed the importance of turnover intention by recognizing job instability due to changes in the employment environment. Based on the verification results, this study confirmed the importance of human resource management (HRM) for people working in the beauty industry and laid the foundation for corporate management.

5. Conclusions

The beauty service industry is leading the creative trend by combining technology (Tech) and beauty in the era of the 4th Industrial Revolution. Employees in the beauty industry are human resources in charge of customer service with professional skills and artistic creativity. The beauty industry is an industry in which the competence of human resources is important, and the behavior and technology of workers are the core products of the service provided to customers. To respond to the rapidly changing environment and technology and secure sustainable growth and competitiveness, companies will need to improve organizational performance by increasing individual and executives' organizational commitment and job satisfaction through various personnel systems and ethical management. The importance of corporate ethics is becoming more emphasized in modern organizations (Qing et al., 2020; Johnson et al., 2006; Asif et al., 2020; Asif et al., 2019). The continuous job commitment and job satisfaction of beauty industry workers have a significant impact on management performance (Rhoades & Eisenberger, 2002; Chen & Eyoun, 2021.) It has an important effect on the success or failure of management as well as the sales performance of a company. In the beauty industry due to changes in the employment environment in the era of the 4th industrial revolution, the turnover rate of human resource management (HRM) and beauty workers is amplifying as social interest. Organizational commitment can be said to have a direct effect on job satisfaction and turnover (Jung & Yoon, 2018; Schwepker et al., 2020; Ruiz-Palomino & Martínez-Cañas, 2014).

The purpose of this study is to reduce the employee's intention to turnover in order to increase commitment to a sustainable organization targeting beauty workers with high human dependence as a result of verifying the relationship between employees' turnover intention for beauty practitioners' job satisfaction, the path from job satisfaction, which is a parameter, to employee turnover intention is significant. Job satisfaction was found to have a negative (-) effect on turnover intention. The result of this analysis is that when job satisfaction is high, the intention to move to another job is low. It was found that employees need systematic human resource management for periodic job management, education management, promotion, and compensation. As a result of this study's analysis, beauty industry workers will be seeking concrete ways to enhance their will to continuously discover the meaning of work in their work.

The implications of this study are as follows. The characteristics of beauty industry workers with high turnover rate are identified, and with the support of companies and organizations, the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention is investigated. The beauty service industry is a labor-intensive industry, and it is said that a stable working environment for workers is also important in order to provide the best service quality for customers (Rhoades & Eisenberger, 2002; Chen & Eyoun, 2021; Jung & Yoon, 2018). The human resource management system should be established by strengthening the career development and capabilities of beauty workers to stabilize employment and improve service quality. Despite these implications, the study's limitations require further research to contribute to continuous management and organizational performance. It is necessary to recognize that job satisfaction and turnover intention can be linked to the meaning of work. This scope was limited to the Korean beauty industry. The limitations of the study should be continued so that they can be generalized through further research.

References

- Ahn, S. H., & Lee, M. H. (2016). Fourth industrial revolution impact: How it changes jobs. Korean Academic Society of Business Administration, 2344-2363
- Allen, N. J., & Meyer, J. P. (1990). The measurement and antecedents of affective, continuance and normative commitment to the organization. *Journal of occupational psychology*, 63(1), 1-18
- Asif, M., Miao, Q., Jameel, A., Manzoor, F., & Hussain, A. (2020). How ethical leadership influence employee creativity: A parallel multiple mediation model. *Current Psychology*, 1-17.
- Asif, M., Qing, M., Hwang, J., & Shi, H. (2019). Ethical leadership, affective commitment, work engagement, and creativity: Testing a multiple mediation approach. *Sustainability*, 11(16), 4489.
- Atchison, T. J. (1991). The employment relationship: un-tied or re-tied?. Academy of Management Perspectives, 5(4), 52-62
- Becker, H. S. (1960). Notes on the concept of commitment. American journal of Sociology, 66(1), 32-40.
- Bluedorn, A. C. (1982). The theories of turnover: Causes, effects, and meaning. Research in the Sociology of Organizations, 1(1), 75-128.
- Brockner, J., Grover, S., Reed, T. F., & Dewitt, R. L. (1992). Layoffs, job insecurity, and survivors' work effort: Evidence of an inverted-U relationship. Academy of Management journal, 35(2), 413-425.
- Caruso, L. (2018). Digital innovation and the fourth industrial revolution: epochal social changes? *Ai & Society*, *33*(3), 379-392.
- Chen, H., & Eyoun, K. (2021). Do mindfulness and perceived organizational support work? Fear of COVID-19 on restaurant frontline employees' job insecurity and emotional exhaustion. *International journal of hospitality* management, 94, 102850.
- Cotton, J. L., & Tuttle, J. M. (1986). Employee turnover: A metaanalysis and review with implications for research. Academy of management Review, 11(1), 55-70.
- DeCanio, S. J. (2016). Robots and humans-complement or substitutes? *Journal of Macroeconomics*, 49, 280-291.
- Ehrhardt, K., Miller, J. S., Freeman, S. J., & Hom, P. W. (2011). An examination of the relationship between training comprehensiveness and organizational commitment: Further exploration of training perceptions and employee attitudes. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 22(4), 459-489
- Eom, H. J., & Lee, E. J. (2020). A Study on Labor Market Changes from Artificial Intelligence (AI) in the Intelligence Information Society. *Information Society & Media*, 21(2), 1-208.
- Furman, J., & Seamans, R. (2019). AI and the Economy. *Innovation policy and the economy*, 19(1), 161-191.
- Guzzo, R. A., Noonan, K. A., & Elron, E. (1994). Expatriate managers and the psychological contract. *Journal of Applied psychology*, 79(4), 617
- Huang, M. H., & Rust, R. T. (2018). Artificial intelligence in service. *Journal of service research*, 21(2), 155-172.

- Jeong JA & Baek UI. (2012) Effects of transformational leadership of hotel employees on job attitudes, the Korean Society of Food Management. (Research Articles: Effects of Transformational Leadership on Employees' Job Attitude among Hotel Employees. *Journal of Food Service Management*, 15(5), 293-313.
- Johnson, R. E., Selenta, C., & Lord, R. G. (2006). When organizational justice and the self-concept meet: Consequences for the organization and its members. Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 99(2), 175-201.
- Jung, H. S., & Yoon, H. H. (2018). Improving frontline service employees' innovative behavior using conflict management in the hospitality industry: The mediating role of engagement. *Tourism Management*, 69, 498-507.
- Jung, W. S., Ynn, X. P., & Park, M. J. (2017). Beauty service market trends in Korea and Japan. Bookk, 2017.
- Kang, S. C., Morris, S. S., & Snell, S. A. (2007). Relational archetypes, organizational learning, and value creation: Extending the human resource architecture. *Academy of management review*, 32(1), 236-256.
- Kim, B., & Kim, B. G. (2018). Antecedents of Turnover Intention: Focused on Employees of Corporation Including Distribution in China, Japan and Korea. *Journal of Distribution Science*, 16(9), 13-23.
- Kim, J. L. (1999) A Study on the Flexibility of the Labor Market and Human Resource Management of Non-regular Workers, Seoul National University *Journal of Industrial Relations*, 95-117
- Kim, S. K. (2018). Tasks and Prospects of 'Arbeit 4.0' of Germany in the Age of the 4th Industrial Revolution. *The Review Eurasian Studies*, 15(1), 117-135.
- Kwak, K. S., & Song, Y. S. (2014). The relation between the job satisfaction factors, degree of occupational satisfaction and turnover intention of hair beauty service industry workers in Korea. *Journal of the Korean society of cosmetology*, 20(20), 583-589.
- Lee, B. H. (2018). The Fourth Industrial Revolution and Labor Relations - Labor-management Conflict Issues and Union Strategies in Western Advanced Countries - Korea Social Policy Review, 25, 429-446.
- Lee, J.J., & Won, Y.S. (2017) A study on the relationship between emotional labor and psychological exhaustion of restaurant employees in hotel companies. *Research on Tourism and Leisure*, 29(7), 181-195.
- Lee, S. H. (2017). The Fourth Industrial Revolution and the Change of Labo, *Future Horizon*, (33), 16-19.
- Lepak, D. P., & Snell, S. A. (1999). The human resource architecture: Toward a theory of human capital allocation and development. *Academy of management review*, 24(1), 31-48.
- Mehta, S., Tiwari, S., Siarry, P., & Jabbar, M. A. (Eds.). (2022). Tools, Languages, Methodologies for Representing Semantics on the Web of Things. John Wiley & Sons..
- Meyer, J. P., & Allen, N. J. (1991). A three-component conceptualization of organizational commitment. *Human* resource management review, 1(1), 61-89.
- Mor Barak, M. E., Nissly, J. A., & Levin, A. (2001). Antecedents to retention and turnover among child welfare, social work,

and other human service employees: What can we learn from past research? A review and metanalysis. *Social service review*, 75(4), 625-661.

- Park, S.H. (2019) A Study on the Relationship between the Hairstylist' Job Stresses and Turnover Intention. *Journal of The Korean Society of cosmetology*, 25(3). p.551.
- Pfeffer, J., & Baron, J. N. (1988). Taking the workers back out: Recent trends in the structuring of employment. *Research in organizational behavior*, 10(1988), 257-303.
- Qing, M., Asif, M., Hussain, A., & Jameel, A. (2020). Exploring the impact of ethical leadership on job satisfaction and organizational commitment in public sector organizations: The mediating role of psychological empowerment. *Review* of *Managerial Science*, 14, 1405-1432.
- Rhoades, L., & Eisenberger, R. (2002). Perceived organizational support: a review of the literature. *Journal of applied psychology*, 87(4), 698.
- Robinson, S. L., Kraatz, M. S., & Rousseau, D. M. (1994). Changing obligations and the psychological contract: A longitudinal study. *Academy of management Journal*, 37(1), 137-152.
- Ruiz-Palomino, P., & Martínez-Cañas, R. (2014). Ethical culture, ethical intent, and organizational citizenship behavior: The moderating and mediating role of person–organization fit. *Journal of business ethics*, 120, 95-108.
- Sandhya, S., & Sulphey, M. M. (2020). Influence of empowerment, psychological contract and employee engagement on voluntary turnover intentions. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 70(2), 325-349
- Schwepker, C. H., Valentine, S. R., Giacalone, R. A., & Promislo, M. (2021). Good barrels yield healthy apples: organizational ethics as a mechanism for mitigating workrelated stress and promoting employee well-being. *Journal* of Business Ethics, 174, 143-159.
- Teagarden, M. B. (2020). Disruption: The Fourth Industrial Revolution accelerator and entrepreneurial ecosystems. *Thunderbird International Business Review*, 62(5), 445-445.
- Tsui, A. S., Pearce, J. L., Porter, L. W., & Tripoli, A. M. (1997). Alternative approaches to the employee-organization relationship: does investment in employees pay off? Academy of Management journal, 40(5), 1089-1121.
- UTAMI, N. M. S., Sapta, I. K. S., VERAWATI, Y., & Astakoni, I. M. P. (2021). Relationship between workplace spirituality, organizational commitment and organizational citizenship behavior. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 8(1), 507-517.
- Williams, L. J., & Anderson, S. E. (1991). Job satisfaction and organizational commitment as predictors of organizational citizenship and in-role behaviors. *Journal of management*, 17(3), 601-617.