

Determinants of Accountants' Loyalty Underlying Investment Management: Evidence from FDI Firms in Thanglong Industrial Park

Dang Huy NGUYEN*, Son Tung HA**, Manh Linh TRAN***, Duc Thang NGUYEN****,
Thi Xuan Hong NGUYEN*****, Dieu Linh NGUYEN*****, Duc Tai DO*****

Received: February 10, 2020 Revised: February 24, 2020 Accepted: March 1, 2020.

Abstract

The research aims to investigate the impact levels of determinants on the loyalty of accountants to FDI firms underlying investment management in Thanglong Industrial Park in Hanoi, Vietnam. We conducted a questionnaire consisting of 31 observation variables with a 5-point Likert scale. Independent variables were measured from 1 "without effect" to 5 "strongly". The method of data collection was done through the survey and subjects are accountants in FDI firms doing business in Thanglong Industrial Park in Hanoi. After checking the information on the votes, there are 120 questionnaires with full information for data entry and analysis. This study employs Cronbach's Alpha test, and regression model. The results show that seven determinants including Working environment, The characteristics of working; Training, promotion prospects and development; Income, Personal characteristic, Collective work together and The method of leading had positive relationships with the loyalty of accountants. Based on the findings, some recommendations are given related to such determinants to improve the loyalty of accountants of FDI firms in general and FDI firms in Thanglong Industrial Park in Hanoi in particular. With which, those firms can enhance performance, reduce financial strain, saving on investment in the recruiting process of new staff, increase profitability to ensure investment management.

Keywords : Employee Loyalty, FDI Firms, Vietnam Accounting System, Performance Management

JEL Classification Code: M40, M41, M48, J30, J31

1. Introduction

*First Author. Lecturer, Vice-dean of the faculty of Accounting, Hanoi University of Business and Technology, Vietnam.
Email: danghuykdcn@yahoo.com

**Corresponding Author. Lecturer, Business Management Faculty, National Economics University, Vietnam [Postal Address: No. 207, Giai Phong Road, Hai Ba Trung District, Hanoi, 113068, Vietnam]
Tel. +84 905 666 680,

Email: hasontungneu@yahoo.com

***Lecturer, Business Management Faculty, National Economics University, Vietnam. Email: linhtm.neu@gmail.com

****Lecturer, Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, Hanoi University of Mining and Geology, Vietnam.
Email: nguyenducthang.ktm@gmail.com

*****Lecturer, The faculty of Accounting and Auditing - Hanoi University of Industry. Email: Nguyenthixuanhong@hau.edu.vn

*****Lecturer, The faculty of Accounting and Auditing - Banking Academy, Vietnam. Email: linhnd@hvn.edu.vn

*****Lecturer, Department of Accounting, University of Labor and Social Affairs, Vietnam. Email: taiketoanquocte@gmail.com

© Copyright: The Author(s)

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>) which permits unrestricted noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Thanglong Industrial Park, Dong Anh District which was established and licensed in 1997, is one of the largest industrial parks in Hanoi. This is a joint venture between Japan and Vietnam. With the development of the Capital's socio-economy, Thanglong Industrial Park has constantly grown in both width and depth and become a modern, civilized model industrial park, which can be compared with the others in regions and global. Until early 2018, Thanglong Industrial Park attracted about 31 foreign investors from Japan, Malaysia, and Singapore, with hundreds of FDI firms with rocketing the total revenues and export quantity. In the global integration era, the race of attracting high-quality human resources, especially in accounting, is one of the hotly debated issues in companies as well as FDI firms in particular (Nguyen & Do, 2019).

The top concern of an enterprise is how to build and maintain a high-quality human resource with a long-term commitment to the company. A business cannot be run effectively and efficiently without the contributions of high qualified and loyal employees (Ha & Vu, 2017). The more loyal employees that a company has, the more success and

competitive advantages it can gain (Cooil, Timothy, Lerzan, & Michael, 2007).

Over the past few years, Vietnam's economy has been developing and integrating with the world. The Vietnamese accounting system also fluctuates in the direction of applying IFRS with a roadmap from voluntary to compulsory application. The average annual employee turnover for business is 15.7 per cent and in FDI firms is from 3-5 per cent monthly, meaning that a large number of employees are rotating jobs every year. This causes challenges for FDI firms in general and FDI firms in Thanglong Industrial Park in particular in terms of employee retention including accounting personnel. For the profession, accountants play an important role in not only providing reliable, objective and valuable information to managers at all levels of the enterprise, helping managers and directors to operate the organization and make right decisions but also implementing regular checking, controlling activities in accordance with terms and conditions in the law; detecting, and promptly correcting economic errors committed in enterprises.

As the above reasons mentioned, it is necessary to analyze factors that affect the loyalty of accountants to FDI firms in Thanglong Industrial Park. By which, these firms can reduce overall costs, generate greater profits, help in growth and sustainability, then enhancing investment management.

2. Literature Review

Edward (1975) asserted that (i) Workspace, (ii) job challenges, (iii) work pressure, (iv) promotion opportunities and (v) chances to express themselves, are the factors that greatly affect employee loyalty. According to Wiley (1997), the main factors affecting employees' loyalty are income, followed by achievements recognition, safety, promotion, interest in work, working conditions, work discipline, personal duties, and empathy. Rajesh (2004) proved that the senior employees are more likely to engage in business, while highly educated employees often have a lower commitment to the organization. Wang and Hsu (2006) considered that the age of employees is the biggest factor affecting employee loyalty, followed by education qualification and marital status, teamwork, job characteristics, leadership.

A rich set of academic works has examined factors influencing the loyalty and satisfaction of personnel. Turkyilmaz, Akman, Ozkan, and Pastuszak (2011) stated that there are 5 factors influencing the satisfaction and loyalty of employees in organizations in Turkey including (i) Training and development opportunities; (ii) recognition; (iii) empowerment; (iv) teamwork; (v) working conditions

that affect employee loyalty and satisfaction. Another research conducted by Hassan, Hassan, Khan, and Iqbal, (2013) in Pakistan's state-owned banks concluded that 3 factors affect the loyalty and satisfaction of workers including Salary and bonus, empowerment and assessment system. Waqas, Bashir, Sattar, Abdullah, Hussain, Anjum, Ali, and Arshad (2014) stated that 5 factors have a direct impact on the loyalty of employees working in Pakistan companies including (i) decision-making process participation, (ii) empowerment, (iii) rewards and recognition, (iv) satisfaction and (v) working conditions.

In Vietnam, Nguyen (2010) showed that job attractiveness is the most important factor affecting employee loyalty, followed by employees' trust in the organization, knowledge about operations and ultimately, fairness. Besides, the research of Nguyen (2010) also confirmed that individual characteristics also have a certain influence on employee loyalty. Nguyen (2012) conducted a survey of 266 employees working at 15 branches of banks in Can Tho city, Vietnam by quantitative research methods. The results of the study showed that 10 factors that positively impact the loyalty of bank employees are: (i) leadership, (ii) working environment, (iii) job characteristics, (iv) salaries, bonuses, benefits, (v) training opportunities, (vi) promotion opportunities; (vii) working conditions, (viii) opportunities for learning and sharpen skills, (ix) seniority and (x) monthly income.

In addition, factors that have adversely influence are education qualification and the number of dependents. Tran (2012) assessed the factors affecting employee loyalty at Dong Tam Joint Stock Company and resulted in three factors as the nature of work, leadership, salary. Mai and Bui (2013) assessed the factors that both directly and indirectly affect employee loyalty through satisfaction. The result showed that there are three factors including Superior support, Teamwork and Working conditions. With the research scope at Green Field Industrial Co., Ltd, an FDI firm majoring in manufacturing metal rings and erasers, Le (2016) identified 5 factors affecting workers' loyalty, which are: Salaries and bonuses; Training and Development; Colleagues and superiors.

Ha and Vu (2017) conducted a direct survey of 209 employees working at the BIDV bank, branch North of Saigon. The authors use quantitative research methods to analyze and measure the factors affecting the loyalty of bank employees and six factors are identified: (i) Income and benefits, (ii) Superiors, (iii) Training and development opportunities, (iv) Job performance evaluation system, (v) co-workers' relationship and (vi) job characteristics. Nguyen, Nguyen, and Nguyen (2020) conducted a direct survey of 320 employees working at small and medium enterprises (SMEs) in Tra Vinh province. The authors use the multivariate regression method, the researchers have

found 6 factors affecting employee loyalty: colleagues, leaders, job characteristics, remuneration policies, organizational culture, and working environment. In addition, there are studies in Vietnam on the influence of independent variables on dependent variables such as

Nguyen, Pham, Le, Truong, and Tran (2020b), and Nguyen, Dang, Pham, and Do, (2020c).

The past research related determinants influencing the employee loyalty that have been drawn from related reference sources, as follows:

No	Factors	Sources
1	Work environment	Edward (1975), Wiley (1997), Turkyilmaz et al (2011), Waqas et al (2014), Nguyen (2012), Mai & Bui (2013), Nguyen et al. (2020)
2	Work characteristics	Edward (1975), Wang & Hsu (2006), Nguyen (2010), Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017), Nguyen et al. (2020)
3	Work pressure	Edward (1975)
4	Training, promotion and development	Edward (1975), Wiley (1997), Turkyilmaz et al (2011), Nguyen (2012), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017)
5	Income (Salary, bonuses, welfare)	Wiley (1997), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al. (2014), Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017), Nguyen et al. (2020)
6	Safe work	Wiley (1997)
7	Feeling pleased in work	Wiley (1997)
8	Work disciplinary	Wiley (1997)
9	Individual characteristics	Wiley (1997), Rajesh (2004), Wang & Hsu (2006), Nguyen (2010), Nguyen (2012)
10	Empathy	Wiley (1997)
11	Collective work collaboration	Wang & Hsu (2006), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Mai & Bui (2013), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017)
12	Leadership style	Wang & Hsu (2006), Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Mai & Bui (2013), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017), Nguyen et al. (2020)
13	Recognition	Wiley (1997), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al. (2014), Ha & Vu (2017)
14	To hand over authority	Edward (1975), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al. (2014)
15	Participate in the decision-making process	Waqas et al. (2014)
16	Satisfaction	Waqas et al. (2014), Mai & Bui (2013)
17	Employee confidence in the business	Nguyen (2010)
18	Knowledge of business operations of the enterprise	Nguyen (2010)
19	Justice in the firm	Nguyen (2010)

To some extents, there have been some other researches related to loyalty of customers such as customer loyalty on brand (Heidari, Alibeigi, & Aghaeifar, 2016), customer loyalty on service quality (Liu & Wang, 2017), effect of marketing mix on customer loyalty (Azimi, 2017) or other factors affected on customer loyalty (Worku, 2019), customer loyalty is a desired and essential result for companies in a business environment with a lot of competition, of which the fashion industry is no exception (Khoa, 2020) and etc. Though these papers don't mention directly on employee loyalty, they provide some suggestions for researching on loyalty.

Related to investment management, it is a rapidly evolving field of finance that happens to have major ramifications on the level and growth of the wealth of society. Gordon, Sharpe and Bailey (2001) describe investment management or portfolio management as the

process of managing money. It may be passive or active, use explicit or implicit procedures and have controlled or uncontrolled risk. The investment management process may be summed up as the art and the science of analyzing, selecting, maintaining, protecting and evaluating the performance with the objective of achieving set investment goals. Measuring performance is an important way in the investment management process. In that light, employee loyalty can have a positive impact on the company performance (Balkyte & Tvaronaviciene, 2010; Cavacoa & Machado, 2015; Tomic, Tesic, Kuzmanovic, & Tomic, 2018).

The loyalty of employees who operate rationally has a significant impact on reducing overall costs (Parmenter, 2007). Companies with loyal employees have a higher rate of survival and better investment management compared to companies with less loyal employees because companies'

success depends upon the quality and loyalty of employees. Reichheld (2001) and Foster, Whysall, and Harris (2008) indicated that companies with greater loyalty among employees, customers and shareholders generate greater profits. Loyal employees help in the growth and sustainability of a company. Employee loyalty reduces a company’s financial strain, saving on investment in the recruiting process of new staff (Aityan & Gupta, 2011).

3. Research Methodology

Based on findings from a number of previous studies of Edward (1975), Wiley (1997), Rajesh (2004), Wang and Hsu (2006), Nguyen (2010), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Hassan et al. (2013), Mai and Bui (2013), Waqas et al. (2014), Le (2016), Ha and Vu (2017), Nguyen et al. (2020) and using qualitative research approach through interviews with experts to perform quantitative research, we identified seven determinants that affect the loyalty of accountants with FDI firms, i.e. (i) Working environment (WE), (ii) The characteristics of working (CW), (iii) Training, promotion prospects and development (TPPD), (iv) Income (I), (v) Personal characteristic (PC), (vi) Collective work together (CWT), and (vii) The method of leading (ML).

Then, we conducted a questionnaire consisting of 31 observation variables with a 5-point Likert scale. Independent variables were measured from 1 “without effect” to 5 “strongly”. The method of data collection was done through the survey and subjects are accountants in FDI firms doing business in Thanglong Industrial Park in Hanoi.

We sent 150 questionnaires and received the feedback of 135. After checking the information on the votes, there are 120 questionnaires with full information for data entry and analysis, the size of this sample is consistent with study of Hair, Anderson, Tatham, and Black (2006) ($n = 50 + 8 \times m = 50 + 8 \times 7 = 106$). Therefore, the rest of observations for model 1 are 120 surveys, including 100% participants who are chief accountants, general accountants and accountant staff in FDI Firms in Thanglong Industrial Park in Hanoi. Participants mostly have Bachelor degree or higher.

As can be seen, all participants are at high quality of accounting knowledge, and this makes surveys’ answer become reliable.

We have employed EFA analysis and regression model to determine the impact levels of determinants on loyalty of accountant with FDI firms. The proposed model is shown in Figure 1.



Figure 1: Research model

Dependent variable: The loyalty of accountants to FDI firms include six attributes (Nguyen et al., 2019).

Independent variable: The independent variables are described as below:

Code	Variables	Sources
Working environment (WE)		
WE1	The firm guarantees equality for all employees	Nguyen (2010), Nguyen (2012)
WE2	The firm always complies with the labor contract and the announced regulations	Nguyen (2012), Edward (1975), Wiley (1997), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Waqas et al. (2014)
WE3	The workplace is equipped with modern facilities which bring employees a sense of comfort	Nguyen (2012), Edward (1975), Wiley (1997), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Waqas et al. (2014),
WE4	The firm fully meets working facilities for accounting work	Nguyen (2012), Edward (1975), Wiley (1997), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Waqas et al. (2014),
The characteristics of working (CW)		
CW1	Working pressure is acceptable	Edward (1975), Nguyen (2012)
CW2	The safety is always guaranteed and put first in our job	Wiley (1997), Nguyen (2012)
CW3	Our job are challenging	Wang & Hsu (2006), Nguyen (2010), Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
CW4	Our job are quite interesting	Wiley (1997), Nguyen (2010)
CW5	Working time is quite appropriate	Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
CW6	This job creates good conditions for them to improve my skills	Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)

Training, promotion prospects and development (TPPD)		
TPPD1	Employees have the chance to participate in professional development training courses	Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
TPPD2	The company's training programs are quite effective	Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
TPPD3	I can get the promotion	Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
TPPD4	The competitiveness to get the advancement in the company is fair and healthy	Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
Income (I)		
I1	The salary is reasonable with the performance	Wiley (1997), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al. (2014), Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
I2	The firm grants clear bonuses	Wiley (1997), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al. (2014), Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
I3	The welfare policy is being improved day by day	Wiley (1997), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al. (2014), Nguyen (2012), Tran (2012), Ha & Vu (2017)
Personal characteristic (PC)		
PC1	I feel satisfied with the job	Waqas et al. (2014), Mai & Bui (2013)
PC2	I have faith in the firm	Wiley (1997), Rajesh (2004), Wang & Hsu (2006), Nguyen (2010), Nguyen (2012)
PC3	I am knowledgeable about the firm's business operations	Wiley (1997), Rajesh (2004), Wang & Hsu (2006), Nguyen (2010), Nguyen (2012)
PC4	I am knowledgeable about both Vietnamese accounting standards and international financial report standards	Nguyen (2010)
Collective work together (CWT)		
CWT1	There is empathy in the accounting department	Wiley (1997)
CWT2	I work independently and in teamwork as well	Wang & Hsu (2006), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Mai & Bui (2013), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017)
CWT3	Employees have a good relationship with their colleagues	Nguyen (2012), Mai & Bui (2013), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017)
CWT4	I learned from my colleagues	Nguyen (2012), Mai & Bui (2013), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017)
The method of leading (ML)		
ML1	The leaders implement a fair and consistent evaluation system	Wiley (1997), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al. (2014), Ha & Vu (2017), Nguyen (2012)
ML2	They make recognition of employees' achievements	Wiley (1997), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al. (2014), Ha & Vu (2017)
ML3	Working discipline is taken seriously	Wiley (1997)
ML4	Employees are involved in the decision-making process	Edward (1975), Turkyilmaz et al. (2011), Hassan et al. (2013), Waqas et al (2014), Nguyen (2012)
ML5	Employees received the support and encouragement from their superiors	Nguyen (2012), Mai & Bui (2013), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017)
ML6	Leaders assign the work appropriately and listen to the opinions of employees	Nguyen (2012), Mai & Bui (2013), Le (2016), Ha & Vu (2017)

4. Research Results

4.1. Descriptive Statistics

Table 1 shows that among 120 respondents, 26.7% of the participants were male while the remaining 88 were female, representing for 73.3%. Of these, 50 of them from 22 to 27 years old, accounting for 41.7%; and 58.3% of the

participants were over 27 years old. Among 120 respondents, accounting staff accounted for 33.2%, general accounting accounted for 38.3%, while the remaining 34 were chief accountant, accounted for 28.3%. Of these, 42.5% of the participants have from 1 to 5 years and over 5 years accounted for 57.5%. Beside, income from the average monthly salary of accountants for over than 15.0 million VND accounted for 52.5%; from 10.0 to 15.0 million VND,

accounted for 19.2%; from 5.0 to 10 million VND accounted for 28.3%.

Table 1: Respondents by gender, age, job description and seniority work

	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Gender			
Male	32	26.7	26.7
Female	88	73.3	100.0
Age			
Over 27 years old	70	58.3	58.3
From 22 to 27 years old	50	41.7	100.0
Job description			
General accountants	46	38.3	38.3
Chief accountants	34	28.3	66.7
Accounting staff	40	33.3	100.0
Seniority work			
Over 5 years	69	57.5	57.5
From 1 to 5 years	51	42.5	100.0
Total	120	100.0	

4.2. Quality Scale Analysis Result

By using scale analysis, it can eliminate inconsonant variables and reduce errors in the research model. Therefore, only variables which have total correlation coefficients (Corrected Item – Total Correlation) greater than 0.3 and Cronbach’s Alpha coefficients equal or greater than 0.6 are accepted (Hair, Black, Babin, & Anderson, 2009; Hoang & Chu, 2008). Analyzing Cronbach’s Alpha of determinants has shown their influence on the loyalty of accountants (7 determinants with 31 observed variables) and the result is presented in Table 2.

Table 2 shows that all Cronbach’s Alpha coefficients of population are above 0.6; all Corrected Item – Total Correlation of observed variables are above 0.3. So, all variables of research model are suitable for next analyses (Hair et al., 2006).

Table 2: Results of analysis of Determinants Confidence of Scales in the Model

Determinants	n	Cronbach’s Alpha	Corrected Item-Total Correlation
Working environment (WE)	4	.718	.374

The characteristics of working (CW)	6	.850	.597
Training, promotion prospects and development (TPPD)	4	.861	.668
Income (I)	3	.802	.546
Personal characteristic (PC)	4	.864	.657
Collective work together (CWT)	4	.861	.668
The method of leading (ML)	6	.862	.557

4.3. Exploratory Factor Analysis (EFA)

EFA were conducted and we used the method of extracting coefficients. The results of Component Analysis and Varimax, Analyzes yields 31 attributes for the independent variables.

Table 3 shows that $0.5 < KMO = 0.823 < 1$. Bartlett’s testimony shows $sig. = 0.000 < 0.05$. It means variables in the whole are interrelated. After implementing the rotation matrix, 7 determinants with factor load factor are greater than 0.5; Eigenvalues are greater than 1; the variance explained is 72.172%, which demonstrates that research data analyzing factor discovery is appropriate. Through the quality assurance of the scale and the test of the EFA model, we have identified 7 determinants influencing the loyalty of accountants.

Table 3: KMO and Bartlett's Test

Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin Measure of Sampling Adequacy.		.823
Bartlett's Test of Sphericity	Approx. Chi-Square	1,238.576
	Df	121
	Sig.	0.000

4.4. Regression Model Analysis

Based on adjusted model after the exploratory factor analysis, we have a multiple regression model as follows:

$$LA = \alpha + \beta_1 WE + \beta_2 CW + \beta_3 TPPD + \beta_4 I + \beta_5 PC + \beta_6 CWT + \beta_7 ML$$

Results of Tables 4, 5, 6 show that:

Multicollinearity testing: all variance inflation factors (VIF) of independent variables are under 2, so multicollinearity of model is low (Hoang & Chu, 2008). Therefore, this regression model does not have any violation of the CLRM basic assumption. Durbin – Watson statistic which is used to test the autocorrelation of residuals

presents the model does not violate when using multiple regression method because Durbin – Watson value is 1.981 (in the interval of 1 and 3). In other words, the model is indicated no autocorrelation of residuals (Hoang & Chu, 2008).

ANOVA testing result: Level of significant (Sig.) = 0.003 implies that multiple regression model is suitable with data. Coefficient of R2 (R Square) = 0.541, which means 54.1% of the total variation in the loyalty of accountants will be explained by the regression model.

Research model result indicates that all independent variables; namely (i) Working environment (WE), (ii) The characteristics of working (CW), (iii) Training, promotion prospects and development (TPPD), (iv) income (I), (v) Personal characteristic (PC), (vi) Collective work together (CWT), (vii) The method of leading (ML) are significant (because Sig. < 0.05) to the loyalty of accountants. Determinants have influences on the loyalty of accountants are presented in the following standardized regression model:

$$LA = 0.226 \times WE + 0.139 \times CW + 0.265 \times TPPD + 0.395 \times I + 0.153 \times PC + 0.101 \times CWT + 0.352 \times ML$$

Table 4: Model Summary^b

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Durbin - Watson
1	.594 ^a	.541	.488	.52138	1.981

a. Predictors (Constant): ML, CWT, WE, CW, TPPD, I, PC

b. Dependent Variable: LA

Table 5: Anova^a

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1 Regression	4.126	7	.210	.677	.003 ^b
Residual	30.718	112	.272		
Total	30.844	119			

a. Predictors (Constant): ML, CWT, WE, CW, TPPD, I, PC

b. Dependent Variable: LA

Table 6: Coefficients^a

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients Beta	T	Sig.	Collinearity Statistics	
	B	Std.				Tolerance	VIF
(Constant)	3.946	.539		7.321	.000		
WE	.186	.080	.226	2.234	.015	.943	1.661
CW	.118	.096	.139	2.132	.041	.790	1.654
TPPD	.255	.101	.265	2.732	.027	.324	1.884
I	.366	.115	.395	2.573	.015	.324	1.839
PC	.139	.134	.153	3.289	.033	.268	1.874
CWT	.092	.029	.101	3.060	.035	.561	1.783
ML	.311	.085	.352	4.126	.029	.939	1.465

a. Dependent Variable: LA

5. Discussion

We used the qualitative and quantitative research methods, processed data by statistical method to analysis, evaluation and measurement determinants influencing the loyalty of accountants to FDI firms underlying investment management. There are 7 factors positively affect the loyalty of accountants in descending: Income (I), The method of leading (ML); Training, promotion prospects and development (TPPD); Working environment (WE), Personal characteristic (PC), The characteristics of working (CW); Collective work together (CWT).

5.1. Income (I)

Income is the factor affecting the loyalty of accountants the most. Results survey show that in FDI firms in Thanglong Industrial Park in Hanoi, the income of accountants varies around 5 million VND/month (around 220 USD/Month) or more, which depends on their position and work experience. The income of a chief accountant is usually over 15 million/ month (around 650 USD/Month), the income of accountants who have worked under 5 years is usually from 5 to 10 million/month (from 220 USD – 430 USD/Month).

Income plays a key role in the daily life of employees. Though major FDI destinations in the country continue to have much higher salaries compared to the rest of Vietnam, employees always expect their income will be increased

year over year. According to the report of Navigos in 2018, FDI firms in Vietnam are under the pressure in recruitment because the proposed salary is not as attractive as companies in other sectors so that candidates tend to switch to other industries. Therefore, in step with maintaining salaries, bonuses and welfare regulations, FDI firms need to improve other policies for employees' benefits, such as support accommodation purchase, provide loans with preferential interest rates; vote and reward monthly (Ha & Vu, 2017). In addition, FDI firms should create good conditions for employees with seniority working for more than 5 years and expecting to receive a salary before one year, which is considered as a loan without interest to support workers.

5.2. The Method of Leading (ML)

Leadership is considered to be a key factor in management as it not only demonstrates the logic in organizing but also shows the talent and the art of commanding of a leader. In the process of leading different teams, the work performances largely depend on the appropriate leadership method. A person who can identify which method of leading is optimal for his/ her organization has a management talent. A good method of leading contributes to rational and effective implementation of the goals and tasks (Bui, 2017).

This factor strongly influences the loyalty of accountants. Thus, FDI firms need to develop the job descriptions for each accounting position so that accountants can better understanding their roles and contributions. In addition, FDI firms also need to set up a job measurement system that is quantified by clear and objective criteria.

Leaders at FDI firms have recognized the contributions of accountants, listened to their opinions and feedback. By holding meetings between accountants and other positions, leaders can have better understanding of their staff.

The majority of leaders at FDI firms are highly qualified and have experience in management. However, they also need to constantly learn to improve both leadership capacity and professional knowledge to meet the development of businesses as well as the development of the economy. Moreover, fueled by continuous growth, Vietnam continues to attract numerous FDI firms. This results in increasing of labour cost. In this scenario, it is paramount that any firms including FDI ones needs to change the method of leading appropriately to retain qualified employees, avoiding or mitigating turnover. This would help FDI firms run smoothly and support future asset growth.

Currently, the Ministry of Finance is developing the roadmap for the application of international financial reporting standards (IFRS) in Vietnam. This requires

managers and accountants understand and get deep insight into IFRSs to apply in their enterprises' accounting system and mentor their employees in the right way.

5.3. Training, Promotion Prospects and Development (TPPD)

Training and development can satisfy demands of employees in tightening the relationship between employees and business, creating a professional style in working, or promoting employee loyalty. Related to investment management, Silvestro (2002) and Tomic et al. (2018) explored the relationship between employee satisfaction, loyalty, productivity and profitability. They came to the conclusion that there was a strong positive correlation between these variables.

According to a MOLISA's report (cited by Mori, Thuy, & Hoang, 2009), 44% of FDI firms have had to organize re-training courses for their employees. It includes training courses for accountants. Though some FDI firms have developed in-house training programs, it is not popular. Some labors have been sent to other countries like Japan, Korea... for on-the-job training, mainly for technicians but not for accountants. This suggests that FDI firms need to care more about training and development for accountants, especially IFRSs-related ones. In addition, other practical skills are also essential to accountants such as communication skills, negotiation skills with customers, tax authorities, banks, auditors ... should be taken into consideration. By providing adequate methodical knowledge, accountants will able to exploit the full potential of the sector. Training and development plans might raise cost of FDI firms but it is a strategic action for long-term investment of firms.

Currently, the Ministry of Finance has implemented international accounting standards (IFRSs), in which voluntary application until 2024 and mandatory application from 2025. Therefore, FDI firms need to develop specific strategies for IFRS training for accountants. The apparent promotion process for each accountant also needs to be improved in FDI firms.

5.4. Working Environment (WE)

The working environment for the accounting department in FDI firms in Thanglong Industrial Park is quite good. They ensured the fairness for all accountants, strictly comply with the labor contracts and the internal regulations; the facilities are quite modern, and fully meet the requirement of accounting work. As doing business in one of the top emerging economies in the world as Vietnam with competitive labour cost, FDI firms not only have a diversity of nationality but also have race in the workplace.

This contributes to improve work efficiency and creative thinking in the workplace environment. Furthermore, accountants in FDI firms typically work in offices to prepare and submit documents in sensitive time and fast-paced working environment. Thus, improving the cohesive and supportive cross functional teams is necessarily. This will create positiveness and effectiveness in working environment in firms. Furthermore, the trade union in FDI firms has operated inefficiently and not fulfilled the role of protecting employees and workers' rights and benefits. Therefore, FDI firms need to take this problem into consideration to ensure more legal rights and benefits for accountants.

5.5. Personal Characteristic (PC)

As shown from the above result, Personal characteristic (PC) has a relatively impact on The loyalty of accountants (LA) to FDI firms in Thanglong Industrial Park. As expected, accountants in FDI firms have high professional qualifications, ability in foreign languages such as English, Japanese, Korean, etc. They have been well-trained at universities with basic subjects to specialized ones. In particular, they have a good understanding of both Vietnamese accounting standards (VAS) and international financial reporting standards (IFRS). They have confidence and a feeling of satisfaction with their jobs. Therefore, FDI firms need to more and more encourage accountants with 5-year seniority working in enterprises to increase their loyalty and then spreading the effect to the others of the enterprise. However, FDI firms always find that it is difficult to recruit qualified accountants. It is often hampered by factors related to physical strength, working behaviour and awareness of professional discipline.

5.6. The Characteristics of Working (CW)

Generally, each FDI labourer has to work around 275.8 hours overtime per year, relatively high compared to other sector. Several companies reported 500-600 extra hours of overtime per year for employees, far exceeding extra time limit regulated by Vietnamese laws (Vietnam News, 2018). This is also in line with the research of Worker Rights Consortium (2013) that excessive working hours occurs in many MNEs in Vietnam. However, the result of the research shows that working time in FDI firms for the accounting department is quite appropriate, accountants are highly satisfied with this indicator. However, the time for physical inventory work is usually incurred on holidays when external agencies such as auditing agencies, tax authorities, etc. come to specify. And this working time has hardly been recorded and granted with bonuses or benefits

by FDI firms. Therefore, FDI firms need to pay more attention to this characteristic.

The work of accountants is challenging but also quite interesting. The challenge for accountants is the application of specialized laws such as business law, commercial law, tax law must be accurate; they have to provide information to the right subjects and keep the information confidential. Therefore, the improvement of the accounting information system in FDI firms is necessary because it contributes to improving the supply and security of information. In addition, accountants will be more active and more interesting in using and designing it.

5.7. Collective Work Together (CWT)

Accountants usually have to both work independently and in groups, because the economic transactions are related to each other. Employees in the accounting department often have support from their colleagues, learning from each other. In order to improve the collective working cooperation in the accounting system, FDI firms need to organize more meetings and also bonding activities for accountants to exchange experiences, provide up to date information among leaders and employees. In addition, the professional examinations for accountants should also be held on a regular basis.

Exercising and outdoors activities not only improve the physical strength and health of workers but also enhance teamwork skills for accountants to coordinate in work. Therefore, these activities need to be strengthened and organized more often in FDI firms.

6. Conclusion

In this paper, we evaluated the impact levels of determinants on the loyalty of accountants to FDI firms underlying investment management in Thanglong Industrial Park, one of the largest industrial parks in Hanoi, Vietnam. We found that there are 7 factors positively affect the loyalty of accountants in descending including Income; The method of leading; Training, promotion prospects and development; Working environment; Personal characteristic; The characteristics of working; Collective work together. Based on the findings, some recommendations are given including creating good working conditions for senior accountants; changing the method of leading appropriately to retain qualified accountants; avoiding or mitigating turnover; focusing more on training and development for accountants, especially IFRSs-related ones; ensuring more legal rights and benefits for accountants; or organizing more meetings and also bonding activities for accountants to exchange

experiences, enhancing teamwork skills. By which, it could improve the loyalty of accountants of FDI firms in general and in Thanglong Industrial Park in Hanoi in particular, enhancing company performance, profitability to ensure investment management.

References

- Aityan, S., & Gupta, T. (2011). Challenges of Employee Loyalty in Corporate America. *Business and Economics Journal*, 2011, BEJ-55. Retrieved from https://astonjournals.com/manuscripts/Accepted/BEJ-55accNov19_2011.pdf
- Azimi, H. (2017). Ranking the effect of services marketing mix elements on the loyalty of customers by using Topsis method (Case study: city bank branches in Tehran). *Innovative Marketing*, 13(2), 41-46.
- Bui, T. P. L. (2017). The influence of leadership styles on employees' engagement at Ho Chi Minh City-based commercial banks. *Economy and Forecasi Review (Vietnam)*, 36, 39-42.
- Balkyte, A., & Tvaronavičienė, M. (2010). Perception of competitiveness in the context of sustainable development: Facets of "Sustainable Competitiveness". *Journal of Business Economics and Management*, 11(2), 341-365.
- Cavacoa, N. M., & Machado, V. C. (2015). Sustainable competitiveness based on resilience and innovation – an alternative approach. *International Journal of Management Science and Engineering Management*, 10(2), 155-164.
- Cool, B., Timothy, L. K., Lerzan, A., & Michael, H. (2007). A Longitudinal Analysis of Customer Satisfaction and Share of Wallet: Investigating the Moderating Effect of Customer Characteristics. *Journal of Marketing*, 71(1), 67-83.
- Edward, H. G. (1975). *Factors Affecting Employee Loyalty* (Thesis). M.S.-Massachusetts Institute of Technology. Alfred P. Sloan School of Management.
- Gordon, J. A., Sharpe, W. F., & Bailey, J. V. (2001). *Fundamentals of investments*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Foster C., Whysall P., & Harris, L. (2008). Employee loyalty: an exploration of staff commitment levels towards retailing, the retailer and the store. *International Review of Retail, Distribution & Consumer Research*, 18(4), 423-435.
- Ha, N.K.G., & Vu, T.K.X. (2017). Factors affecting the loyalty of BIDV employees – Northern branch of Saigon. *Industry and Trade Magazine (Vietnam)*, 12 (11/2017), 139-145.
- Hair, J. F., Anderson, R. E., Tatham, R. L., & Black, W. C. (2006). *Multivariate data analysis*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall International Inc.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E. (2009). *Multivariate Data Analysis* (7th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall International.
- Hassan, M., Hassan, S., Khan, M. F. A., & Iqbal, A. (2013). Impact of HR Practices on Employee Satisfaction and Employee Loyalty: A Empirical Study of Government Owned Public Sector Banks of Pakistan. *Middle – East Journal of Scientific Research*, 16(1),1-8.
- Heidari, M. G., Alibeigi, H., & Aghaeifar, A. (2016). An analytical study on customer perception of store environment and its effect on brand loyalty through joy of shopping (a case study: LG home appliance store). *Problems-And-Perspectives-In-Management*, 14(3), 380-387. [http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/ppm.14\(3-si\).2016.11](http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/ppm.14(3-si).2016.11).
- Hoang, T., & Chu, N. M. N. (2008). *Analyzing researched data with SPSS* (2nd ed.). Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam: Hong Duc Publishing House.
- Khoa, B. T. (2020). The Antecedents of Relationship Marketing and Customer Loyalty: A Case of the Designed Fashion Product. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 7(2), 195-204. <https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no2.195>
- Le, T. T. (2016). *Determinants influencing the loyalty of employees in Green Field company* (Thesis). University of Economics Ho Chi Minh City, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam.
- Liu, C. M., & Wang, T. Y. (2017). A study on the effect of service quality on customer loyalty and corporate performance in financial industry. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 15(2), 355-363, [http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/ppm.15\(2-2\).2017.05](http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/ppm.15(2-2).2017.05).
- Mai, N. K., & Bui, D. T. (2013). Factors influencing employee loyalty directly and indirectly through job satisfaction - A study of banking sector in Ho Chi Minh City. *International Journal of Current Research and Academic Review*, 1(4), 81-95.
- Mori, J., Thuy, T. T. X., & Hoang P. T (2009). *Skill Development for Vietnam's Industrialization: Promotion of Technology Transfer by Partnership between TVET Institutions and FDI Enterprises*. Retrieved January 10, 2020, from http://www.grips.ac.jp/vietnam/VDFTokyo/Doc/Mori_SkillsDevVN.pdf.
- Nguyen, D. H., & Do, D. T. (2019). The impact of equity in FDI firms on accountants' loyalty: Application of equity theory and creative application in economics sociological knowledge. *Accounting*, 6, 215-220.
- Nguyen, D. H., Nguyen, H. L., Nguyen, T. T. N., & Do, D. T. (2019). The loyalty of accountants to FDI firms in Thanglong industrial park – Creative application in economics sociological knowledge. *Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development*, 10(20), 48-54.
- Nguyen, D. V., Dang, D. Q., Pham, G. H., & Do, D. K. (2020c). Influence of Overconfidence and Cash Flow on Investment in Vietnam. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 7(2), 99-106. <https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no2.99>
- Nguyen, H. H., Nguyen, T. T., & Nguyen, P. T. (2020). Factors Affecting Employee Loyalty: A Case of Small and Medium Enterprises in Tra Vinh Province, Viet Nam. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 7(1), 153-158. <https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no1.153>
- Nguyen, Q. N. (2012). Determinants influencing the loyalty of bank employees. *Journal of Development Economics*, 259, 22-29.
- Nguyen, T. M. T. (2010). Determinants influencing the loyalty of marketing staff. *Journal of Development Economics*, 237, 26-30.
- Nguyen, T. T. D., Pham, T. M. L., Le, T. T., Truong, T. H. L., & Tran, M. D. (2020b). Determinants Influencing Tax Compliance: The Case of Vietnam. *Journal of Asian Finance,*

- Economics and Business*, 7(2), 65-73.
<https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no2.65>
- Rajesh, J. B. (2004). *A Case Study of Job Satisfaction among Bank Employee of Leading Nationalised Banks of Gujarat State, India* (Thesis). University of Central Arkansas, Conway, Arkansas.
- Reichheld, F. F. (2001). Lead for loyalty. *Harvard Business Review*, 79(7), 76-84.
- Parmenter, D. (2007). *Key performance indicators: Developing, implementing and using winning KPIs*. New York, NY: John Wiley.
- Silvestro, R. (2002). Dispelling the modern myth: Employee satisfaction and loyalty drive service profitability. *International Journal of Operations and Production Management*, 22(1), 30-49.
- Tomic, I., Tesic, Z., Kuzmanovic, B., & Tomic, M. (2018). An empirical study of employee loyalty, service quality, cost reduction and company performance. *Economic Research-Ekonomska Istraživanja*, 31(1), 827-846.
- Tran, D. M. D. (2012). *Determinants influencing the loyalty of employees in Dong Tam Joint Stock Company* (Thesis). University of Economics Ho Chi Minh City, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam.
- Turkylmaz, A., Akman, G., Ozkan, C., & Pastuszak, Z. (2011). Empirical study of public sector employee loyalty and satisfaction. *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 111, 675-696.
- Vietnam News. (2018). *FDI sector faces shortage of skilled labour*. Retrieved January 10, 2020, from <https://vietnamnews.vn/society/450190/fdi-sector-faces-shortage-of-skilled-labour.html#oTWM3KLVF9wWocWo.97>.
- Wang, J., & Hsu, C. (2006). *Influencing Factors of Employee Loyalty: A Case Study of Hotels in Heifei, China*. The Fifth Asia Pacific Forum for Graduate Student Research in Tourism, Bangkok, Thailand, September 20-22, 2006.
- Waqas, A., Bashir, U., Sattar, M. F., Abdullah, H. M., Hussain, I., Anjum, W., Ali, M. A., & Arshad, R. (2014). Factors influencing job satisfaction and Its impact on job loyalty. *International Journal of Learning & Development*, 4, 141-161.
- Wiley, J. (1997). *Negative Effects of Domain Knowledge on Creative Problem Solving*. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Cognitive Science Society, Palo Alto, CA.
- Worker Rights Consortium. (2013). *Global Wage Trends for Apparel Workers, 2001- 2011*. Washington D.C.: Centre for American Progress. Retrieved from <https://cdn.americanprogress.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/07/RealWageStudy-3.pdf>.
- Worku, Z. (2019). Factors that affect customer loyalty in small enterprises. *Innovative Marketing*, 15(4), 78-87. [http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/im.15\(4\).2019.07](http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/im.15(4).2019.07).