

수퍼비전 관계형성 실행경험에 대한 내러티브 탐구

Narrative Inquiry on the Actual Experience of a Supervisory Relationship in Korea

주은선

덕성여자대학교 심리학과

Eunsun Joo(esjoo77@gmail.com)

요약

본 연구는 수퍼비전을 통한 수퍼바이저와 수퍼바이지의 관계형성에 대한 내러티브적 묘사이다. 즉, 수퍼바이저 A의 삶과 수퍼바이지 B의 삶 속에서 맺고 있는 그들의 관계를 있는 그대로 기술 및 설명하였다. 본 연구로부터 얻은 결론은 진솔성과 개방성은 인간중심 상담의 핵심요소이며, 특히 수퍼바이저의 무조건적인 수용에 대한 노력은 수직관계 형성으로 '은폐' 방법을 사용하기 쉬운 수퍼바이저의 태도를 더욱 개방적으로 유도할 수 있었다. 이것은 수퍼비전의 관계는 상하관계라는 기존의 시각에 새로운 관점을 제시한다. 수퍼비전에 초보 수퍼바이지들을 적극적으로 참여 할 수 있도록 수퍼바이지들이 먼저 수용하고 신뢰할 수 있는 분위기와 라포(rapport)를 형성한다면, 수퍼비전의 관계는 수직에서 수평으로 더욱 진전될 수 있음을 본 연구를 통하여 알 수 있었다.

■ **중심어** : | 내러티브 탐구 | 수퍼비전 관계 | 인간중심접근 | 3차원적 내러티브 탐구 공간 |

Abstract

This research presents the relationship building between the supervisor and supervisee through the supervision process in a narrative inquiry. The supervisory relationships of the supervisor A and supervisee B, and the effects they have on the relationship between the two are described in as factual terms as possible. The results imply that genuineness and openness are the core components of relationship. Especially, in the case of a highly hierarchical relationship, where it is often easy for the supervisor to employ hidden tactics, efforts on the part of the supervisor's endeavor to develop unconditional acceptance can be helpful in establishing a more open-minded attitude. As a result, the common view in the literature that attributes relationship hierarchy to cultural factors may need to be reexamined. This research provides evidence that in the case of supervision and training in counseling, establishing an environment of acceptance, trust and rapport can help advance the supervisory relationship to a less hierarchical form.

■ **keyword** : | Narrative Inquiry | A Supervisory Relationship | Person-centered Approach | Three-dimensional Narrative Inquiry Space |

I. Introduction

Essential requirements to become a professional

counselor include understanding of counseling theories, training and experience with counseling skills and also supervisor's systematic and consistent

접수일자 : 2017년 07월 26일

수정일자 : 2017년 09월 14일

심사완료일 : 2017년 09월 15일

교신저자 : 주은선, e-mail : esjoo77@gmail.com

training approach in his/her supervision, among others[1]. Especially, clinical supervision experiences in which a professional counselor with all the necessary knowledge and skills continuously observes and evaluates counseling processes are surely required to develop his/her professionalism[2]. Through such supervision, the supervisors can: (1) supervise and give advice to the supervisees regarding their counseling practice; (2) protect the clients' well-being and; (3) help the supervisees advance their growth and development to become an independent professional counselor [2]. This leads us to conclude that the supervisee's self-examination must take priority over anything else in the supervision process. That is to say, the main purpose of supervision is to provide the clients with service of a quality which can be successful through a proper counseling education, and introspection of oneself. Then, this leaves us with the question, 'What makes the supervision effective?'

This research is centered on a model based on psychotherapy and therefore, various concepts and experiences developed for psychotherapy are used for counseling processes. Among various psychotherapies such as psychoanalysis, cognition-behavior and person-centered, will take a closer look especially at the person-centered approach. The person-centered approach believes that a client has one's own ability to solve problems by him/herself, through continuous confrontations in his/her life with one's own goals without any direct approach of a therapist such as interpretation or directions.

The purpose of this research is to present the relationship building between a supervisor and a supervisee through the supervision process in a narrative inquiry. First, we will look at the concept and features of a narrative inquiry. Also, using three dimensional narrative inquiry space, the researchers

will take a closer look at the life stories of the volunteers for this research and describe them in detail, which will make a narrative both inquiry a direct and indirect means to research counseling. The agenda is 'What do the supervisor and the supervisee experience in a person-centered supervisory relationship?' The focus of this paper will be to explain the process of building the relationship. This research chose to use a qualitative method of the two main research methods, quantitative and qualitative. In light of the characteristics of the qualitative method, great care is needed in generalizing the results or implications of this research[3]. We acknowledge that this research is only based on a specific case which took place in a certain scene within a limited time.

II. Theoretical Background of Supervision

Many scholars believe that the first requirement of effective supervision lies in building a positive and productive relationship between a supervisor and a supervisee[4][5]. Consequently, the most important factor in the supervision is what the supervisee thinks of the supervisor as a person. If their relationship is based on cooperation and acceptance, the counseling techniques and experiences of the supervisor can provide supervisees with much help[5]. Yontef emphasizes such a relationship between the two and he asserts that the growth and development of psychotherapy can be achieved through their relationship[6]. Carifio and Hess[7] conducted research which investigated the qualifications of ideal supervisors and professional counselors and the result was surprising. The required qualifications were very similar to each other. In this research, the ideal supervisor means the nature of teachers in general

and the ideal professional counselor means the nature of counselors who carry out counseling practices. One of the qualifications to be an ideal supervisor is that the supervisor needs to have educational goals to be taught and teaching strategies to accomplish those goals and further, accepts the thoughts, feelings and competence of the supervisees. The qualifications to be an ideal professional counselor include a great store of counseling experience, a deep emotional empathy, unconditional positive regard, and the sincerity and openness required for effective counseling. Such qualifications are very similar to those of supervisors or professional counselors with the person-centered approach as background.

The supervision in such a person-centered model stresses that the relationship between a supervisor and a supervisee should be a kind of partnership. In other words, the supervision can be more effective when a supervisor provides complete support and creates such an atmosphere that the supervisee can develop for him/herself one's own capability to provide effective counseling, rather than one-sided directions or advice. Further, Lamders said that if you are a supervisor with the person-centered approach "the therapist is interested in nothing but only in facilitating one's capability to build a relationship and being entirely with the client through self-disclosure"[8]. This shows how much he stresses the openness of a therapist (counselor).

In contrast, Davenport has a different perspective. He said that it is true that say it is not always comfortable to both professor and student for the supervisor to give assessment to the student in supervision, but it is an essential part of it. In addition, the supervision with the person-centered approach may neglect the legal and ethical guidance which should be strictly applied to their practices. Such an approach is one where educational aspect is

more emphasized in supervision rather than human relational aspect[9].

The two confronting perspectives also give us two different outlooks on the roles of a supervisor and a supervisee. While Worthington & Roehlke[10] give weight to the educational aspect in supervision and pay attention to direct teaching and structured supervision as the role of the supervisor, Krause & Allen[11] give weight to the human relational aspect between a supervisor and a supervisee, paying attention to their partnership which can help personal growth through self-acceptance and understanding as a role of the supervisor. Such contradictory opinions may be caused by different preferences regarding expectations and the tastes of supervisees and the role of supervisors. Then, this leads us to a question 'In such a non-directive person-centered approach in supervision, how can a supervisee learn?' Especially, considering that everyone agrees that a supervisee tends to prefer an educational and direct approach by a supervisor, how can a person-centered model in supervision satisfy their needs? The researchers can find the significance of this research in that it views the supervisory relationship between a supervisor and a supervisee through their own lives as a whole.

III. Methodology

A narrative inquiry can mainly be classified into two different kinds. One is a technical inquiry which is related to a question starting with 'how' and the other is an expository inquiry which is related to a question starting with 'why'. The former can be objective as it relates to a process of a certain event whereas the latter is subjective as it relates to explanation of the reasons for the event. This means that the technical inquiry is to describe objectively a

narrative containing various meaningful events and the expository inquiry is a subjective explanation of the reasons for origination, process, and consequence of the events by the narrator. It is not necessary to choose only one type from those two kinds of inquiries. What is considered a good narrative is one which describes vividly the events in detail with proper use of both methods[12][13].

Narrative Inquiry is a method as well as an object of research. One effective way to conduct narrative inquiry is to use 'three-dimensional narrative inquiry space'[3][13][14]. The three-dimensional inquiry space contains three significant concepts which are time, place and interaction. At first, time and place can be indicated by four different directions: inward, outward, backward and forward[13][15]. Among those four directions, backward and forward indicate the longitude which tells one's own consecutive experiences in the past, present, and future, while inward and outward indicate the latitude which tells experience with one's own personal or social life space. An experience with interaction is a process of disentangling one's experiences with two or more people. It can be achieved by repeatedly narrating their life stories which are tangled in places, the longitude and time, the latitude.

In terms of counseling, it can be considered a human act to share one's own experience through storytelling by a counselor and a client. This leads us to believe that storytelling is one of the best ways of understanding one's experience. A narrative inquiry is a research method in which a narrative can also be an object of research and such stories are both experienced and told at the same time. People live by telling their stories. They make over their stories having confirmed and re-telling the stories with corrections. Their stories are themselves a human experience and a life. Therefore, such narrative

inquiry which considers a human as a whole rather than a sum of pieces and also which studies one's life experience through storytelling is the most valid way of studying the person-centered counseling method, which places a person in the center of counseling and disentangles one's experience through continuous storytelling by a counselor and a client.

IV. Into Three Dimensional Inquiry Space

1. Participants

This research contains real experience of personal supervision which is one of the requirements to be qualified as a top-level counseling psychologist. Participants were selected based on a possibility of continuously able to meet as a supervisor, a supervisee and a researcher at the time and place of research. Participants include a supervisor who leads a personal supervision, a supervisee, and a researcher who observes the relevant scenes. Those three people are the researchers as well as the participants in this research.

The researcher A lived in the USA for some of her childhood and adolescent years. Once she completed her BA degree in psychology in Korea, she went back to the USA to obtain her doctorate in clinical and counseling psychology. She continued to stay in the USA to practice her profession as a psychotherapist. Her present activities include teaching, researching and practicing counseling at a Korean university in a metropolitan area. She made a great effort to balance those three areas. She has previously shared her experience through public journals and interviews. As a participant in this research, she shared her studies and information on counseling theories, as well as her experiences that she had as a supervisor. Also she has shared her views very openly for this research.

The researcher B's major in BA was early childhood education and she completed her MA in counseling psychology. After completing her MA, she ran a kinder-garden for 10 years. She plans to enter university for her doctorate course in counseling psychology in the near future. At present she participates in a personal supervision program. One of the reasons that she participates in this program can be explained by her strong belief that counseling people, especially those suffering from cancer, is her vocation. Her involvement in the process of repeating her stories through journal and interviews requested by the researcher C together with her studies in counseling theories contributed much to this research.

The researcher C's major in BA was education. He had an opportunity to learn about a narrative inquiry during his doctorate course for education abroad. He is a researcher at a teaching-learning development center of a university in the metropolitan area. He introduced the narrative inquiry to the other two researchers and has assisted them in finding research materials on narrative inquire and in reflecting views and perspectives of each in the process of repeated reading and writing.

In conclusion, the above shows that each of the three researchers had an equal involvement in this research rather than one person or only some of them participating. This is the quality of a narrative inquiry. The object of this research is the life experiences that A and B shared together from 1997, when they met as a professor and a student in B's MA course, when B had a 'personal supervision' experience. It is only natural in a narrative inquiry to deal with the part of her life, including her childhood, which could be related to her personal supervision. This research provides a closer examination of the whole process of repeated storytelling of their lives in which they had a chance to reflect on their lives and

to emphasize the capability and courage to explore themselves through the lens of three dimensional narrative inquiry.

2. Place for narrative

A. Safe place for narrative: Knowledge Community

A knowledge community is a community within which the professionals from various fields affect one another directly and indirectly. This research group composed of three researchers may be a knowledge community given that they are all related to person-centered counseling. Researcher A has professional knowledge and experience in the person-centered counseling field and Researcher B went through many experiences of counseling children and their parents while she ran a kinder-garden. Researcher C had experiences related to counseling while he took lectures in educational psychology.

A knowledge community assists the members in internalizing their professional knowledge. Craig once said that a knowledge community helps the members understand how they can internalize their professional knowledge as well as pays warm attention to the process of research by professionals in practice. Such a knowledge community is a safe place to share their own professional experiences, discuss with each other, and justify and assure their own interpretation of the situation they are put in [16][17]. Therefore, a knowledge community is built not on the rules of government or of an institute of some kind, such as who must know what is considered good counseling, but on the general experiences of the professional counselors [3][15].

Two huge knowledge communities can be the place for this research. One is A's office (at the university) which is the most safe and familiar place to the participants and the other is the supervision room

where A and B carry out their supervision sessions.

B. Safe place for narrative: Professor's office

A's office is located on the 4th floor of the building located on the right of the main building. It has very limited space. A very much welcomed the first visit, having moved her chair to make some space for the visitors.

Our discussion included: how to precede with the research from then on, what would be the research methods and how to approach and go over the relevant articles and schedules for the research. The researchers could witness how strong their passion was in this research through a series of meetings. B was overwhelmed by the fact that her own story would be in the research paper, having been, on the other hand, embarrassed about it as well. The researchers once again appreciated the fact that this space where meetings can be arranged whenever their schedules allowed and share their stories with great sincerity.

C. Safe place for narrative: Supervision room

The supervision office is located in central Seoul area. When C arrived at the building a young female clerk gave him a pass card for entrance after he wrote my name down on the visitors list and left his ID card at the desk. The office was divided into four rooms. Among those three, the biggest one was used for supervision. The chairs for supervisees were placed around a big rectangular table. A and B usually use this place when they learn and discuss the person-centered counseling theory with other supervisees. Also, it is a cozy place for them to discuss and share views over recorded cases in counseling practice and to continue to examine one-self during self-analysis (C, Personal journal, p.1).

3. Interaction for narrative

A. A's story

A was a long awaited child by her parents and brought up with great love from them. Her father used to be a teacher, and this might have affected the fact that she received warm care and special attention from teachers in elementary school. When her father decided that the family will leave for USA, she was very much in shock and took it as a challenge. She looked back on that time. "... Hmmm... In a way I was short of nothing at that time. I thought... my grades in school are in the upper ranks. The teachers loved me and I had many friends... I thought 'why should I leave all these behind and go to America? And it is not even my own decision.' ... I felt I had no power in decision making in my own life..." (A, Interview, p. 2)."

A confessed that her life in America was nothing compared to the shock she had when she came back to Korea. The education system in America she had experienced was totally different from the one in Korea. Korean students couldn't have their freedom in many things from hair style to what to wear, and also the educational system in Korea was only focused on cramming and memorization. It was a huge cultural shock to her.

"When I got back from the US, it was much harder than the life in America. When I got back, it was my dark days. I can hardly remember those days. I had to have my hair short soon after my arrival and wore the school uniform. I felt kind of stuck. I had to memorize everything I learned at school and I couldn't figure out why. The cultural shock I had at that time was much bigger than the one I experienced in the US (A, Interview, p. 3)."

She was looking for a person to share her agony in her dark days and she realized that many other people were having psychological difficulties. Her memories

went back to her younger days in the college town where she could easily come across psychologists and A's dream as a psychologist. When A was appointed as a professor in Korea, she met B, who was in agony in her class. When people have a similar emotional feelings, they feel closer to each other.

"I happened to meet the professor A while I was in agony. Her class that I attended for the first time, she was taking about potatoes. She said that potatoes grow for themselves once they are given a proper environment like water, temperature and light. I felt her warm heart all through the lecture and I can still vividly remember her warm eyes looking at me (B, Personal journal, p. 1)."

A decided to continue her study abroad to build up more professional knowledge. She tried to look for a professor and university that was the best in the world and to become qualified as a professional counseling psychologist.

"I don't think I remember that I slept more than 3 or 4 hours in my first three years of study in the US. I was ready to sacrifice even my life over study at that time. People think it is a very fancy job and easy to become successful in this field. What I mean is that some people decide to enter this profession without giving it considerable thought. This is a very serious business. Especially when I think that what we do can be compared with dealing with one's life without knives and guns, I believe we need to be ready for many things. In fact, some people say that they enter this profession simply because 'I like meeting people' or 'people like talking to me'. I can get very angry when I hear such a naïve thought from people (chuckled) (A, Interview, p. 10)."

When she returned to Korea to become a professor, she realized that many students in Korea feel ashamed that the university where she worked was not one of the elite ones in Korea, it reminded

her of her old days. "I had been told that I was a very bright student with a great potential but this school is not what I wanted, this is not the university I wanted to enter" (A, personal journal, p. 1). Her journal reminded me of myself in my old days. I also had the same thought since the university was not what I aimed at" (C, personal journal, p. 1)." This is not an unusual feeling that only A or her student had. C myself graduated from a university located outside of Seoul and he has no intention of telling which university he graduated from unless he is asked. C asks himself why it makes him feel ill at ease. He have to face the fact that he can't free himself from Korean society. Whether he likes it or not, it is part of his life.

A met B, a student in a master degree program for counseling psychology in Graduate program in a University in 1997. A's passion and affection for B was special as it was her first year as a professor and B also felt A's passion in her life to communicate with the world only based on her capacity. "I had special care for her as she was my first graduate student. When she was thinking about giving up writing her dissertation, I gave her courage to hang on to it. I truly believed that she could overcome it and complete her study" (A, Personal journal, p. 1)."

B was having a difficult time with her husband's family and it was a very hard time for her to finish her study during her pregnancy. But A expressed her expectations towards B and tried to facilitate what was the best way possible to improve oneself to the fullest.

When B told A that she was planning to start a doctorate program after so many years, A didn't feel any distance, nonetheless she felt a sense of duty and thought it was about time. Though B had enthusiasm, A witnessed that B had to take care of her family and child and she was always sorry for her child.

Having participated in supervision programs at the supervision office, they had continuous meetings and they have completed the first semester and are now in the second semester. **A** described **B** as follows:

“**B** has participated in the supervision programs with a great passion and she was always punctual, very diligent and neat. She always listened very carefully to the supervisors’ feedback, even if it was for other supervisees. But she hardly expressed her opinions. She seemed to dislike creating a conflict and seemed to accept my responses in general. However, it was regrettable that she did not submit any of her views, queries or any specific feedback (A, Interview, pp. 2-3).”

A was sad to see **B** having a difficult time in sharing her opinions with sincerity, especially because she pursues person-centered approach. If one looks at **B**’s case, one “can see her concern and affection for her clients, but her clients seemed not to have felt that” (A, personal journal, p. 3). That is, **A** felt that **B** lacked the ability to show her clients her own responses to let them know she understood what they went through and that this should be improved. **A** introduced one extract scene from **B**’s supervised cases.

“**B**’s responses for her client as a counselor were normally that from a textbook which were not even close to what the client would go through. Especially in the case of a client who was very dependent on her husband, **B** seemed to relate the client’s case to herself and went on to feel that **B** herself was being covered since she had no income. If the client felt intimidated, then all you need to say is ‘Right, that is what you feel right now.’ But instead, she felt frustrated. It could be easily witnessed that **B** hoped her client did not feel intimidated (A, Interview, p. 3).”

A said that **B** was always ready to absorb anything that **A** teaches like a sponge. It was fortunate that **B**

was able to face her ‘own self and learn ‘self-care’.

“Whenever I think about us, I couldn’t help giggling. I was a newly posted professor who was only full of courage and passion, but with no experience with a student. There I met my first graduate student. We met again after more than ten years since her MA graduation and now we learn more and more about each other. Life is a mystery and full of surprises, which are good surprises!!! (A, Personal journal, p. 4).”

B. B’s story

B was outstandingly good at mathematics. In fact, solving mathematics problems were even one of her interests and she planned to apply for a college of mathematics or medicine. However, she made mistakes in her CSAT and she went to a university to major Childhood Education having followed her parents’ decision. During her study in her university, she took a lecture on educational psychology and it really raised her interest in psychology. Also, many relatives came to her and asked for counsel. She recalls her childhood as follows:

“I have many relatives on my father’s side and they came to me to get my opinions on certain issues. They usually asked me “What do you think of this or that? Also, my mother came to me to ask my opinion on some pending issues. They treated me as an adult thinking I had the thoughts for right decisions (B, Interview, p. 2).”

She often had to counsel the parents of children while she was running a kinder-garden. **B** thought she needed professional knowledge for counseling and the next thing she knew she became **A**’s first graduate student. **B** still remembers the day when she took **A**’s first lecture. “Having heard the story that potatoes grow for itself once they are given a proper environment, I felt comfort, her warm heart and a

great passion all through her lecture” (B, Interview, p. 1).“

When she started her graduate study, she was having a baby and it was out of her capacity to carry on with her studies. She had a talk with **A** about her difficult situation. **A** gave her great courage and helped her in many aspects. She supported her in every way possible saying “Let’s overcome this hard time together. If you give up now, you may never be able to start again. I’ll help you. Let’s do it together” (B, Interview, p. 2). She thinks that such warmth that **A** showed to her was the driving force for her to overcome such difficult times.

There was another problem which was much harder than running a kindergarten or nurturing her newly born baby. It was a relationship problem with her husband’s family. His family often interfered with her life and gave her a hard time.

“My life was tiresome and difficult, but **A** made me fulfill my desire to study and it was always delightful to meet her as she was very humane, not like one of those professors who would like to assert their authority” (B, Interview, p. 3)... I was unable to meet her expectations even though she took good care of me as her first student and wanted to teach me many things. I was having a very hard time and wanted to give up. **A** was very strict, too. She was very caring outside the relationship as a teacher and a student, but she was very calm and firm at the university. I remember I cried a lot. Nevertheless, she encouraged me to finish my dissertation. I am proud of myself for what I’ve done and I can’t thank her enough for what she did for me. She also bought me a present to congratulate me on my graduation and it is still precious to me (B, Personal journal, p. 2).“

B had many counseling experiences with children and their parents while she ran a kinder-garden and she was happy to see them feel better after her

counseling. Then, **B** was able to live away from her husband’ family. She moved to an island in Korea to follow her husband’s workplace. “The island is my spiritual origin. It is the place where I feel the most comfortable and it helped my soul to grow” (B, Personal journal, p. 2).“ She had a wonderful time there and the days she spent there were a big turning point in her life. It gave her family a chance to get much closer and she had her own time to accept her husband and children for what they were. She describes the time as follows:

“I had relaxation for the first time after my marriage when my husband had to work in an island for one and a half years. I was very happy to be away from my husband’s family. It gave me some kind of freedom from the duties and responsibilities related to them. In the beginning, I was so lonely that I could kill myself, but I realized how important I was after I met God. Until then, I didn’t know who I was. I hated myself for what I was. I had more than two hours of prayer time everyday for myself in order to make myself own room in me and reflect on myself and what I’d done wrong. I found myself grow inside more and more everyday since I got closer with God. In those days, I started to get to know what I needed to do in my life. So, I prayed for God and was ready to go wherever God guided me (B, Interview, p. 5).“

B met **A** again in April 2009. She missed **A** and wondered what it would be like to see her again after all those years. She felt rather that she met an old friend who gave a sense of comfort and warmth. **A** made **B** have confidence in herself and provided endless support for her decision when **B** told her that she wanted to continue her study. **B** felt somewhat strange to start her study in her doctorate course all over again.

It seems there is no end in studying psychological counseling. **B** started to feel she needed supervision

and started personal supervision. She was all excited about the first supervision as if she had gone back to the time when she had the first lecture ever in psychology. She says “my mind for the first supervision was such that I started all over again from the beginning” (B, Personal journal, p. 2). “The program is mainly divided into three parts. The first hour focuses on theories such as the person-centered approach, the next hour is for discussion on the recording script of a real counseling case and the last hour is for self analysis. As the last hour for self analysis deals with very personal issues, it is very important to make sure it is strictly confidential and it is the time and place where it is considered the most crucial to build trust between the supervisor, A and B, the supervisee who are taking the supervision class. B describes the times of self analysis and her personal thoughts and feelings about it as follows:

“I had time for my own space during my self-analysis. I normally read the Bible and I meditate after I chose some words or sentences which I feel the most strongly about or have interest in from the Bible. I do it everyday. **A** required me to write down my everyday feelings and emotions during self-analysis and bring the note with me for the next visit. It is for sure that if I do self-analysis everyday, I can develop my ability to observe the inner strength and realize the origin of my emotions because I can be sensitive to my own feelings and emotions. I love the process of self analysis. The more I clear my mind and deal with my emotions, the better a listener I can be (B, Personal journal, p. 1).”

The verbatim reports for personal supervision and conversations with **A** made **B** have a wider and new perspective on counseling. She had an opportunity to take a closer look at non-verbal communication she made and her mind set as an objective observant.

A was able to change the whole mind set of **B** for

counseling through such analysis work. **B** describes the emotions that she felt during the analysis as follows:

“When I counsel my client, I only concentrated on his/her superficial story line so that I had no room in my mind to read the client’s true feelings and emotions hidden between the lines. A said “the story itself is not important. You need to listen carefully to what makes the client so frustrated”, but I was not at all sensitive about the client’s feelings. I realized that I needed more training in listening whenever I had a relationship in general. **A** advised me to listen to what a client wants with the mind set that “the client in front of me right now is the most important person to me.” Also, **A** told me I had to be adaptable to anyone. I am not usually an adaptable person because of my stereotypical views and prejudices. Still, there are certain types of people I don’t like without a reason. It is not his/her problem, but it is mine. I once had a client who was so stubborn and had her own strong views so very different from mine. I felt so uncomfortable at first, but I was soon able to have fun when I started to accept her for what she was. Now I’m getting to know myself. I am still on the process of finding out what kind of people I feel uncomfortable with and why (B, Interview, p. 21).”

During a counseling session, **B** normally felt an obligation to solve the client’s problems rather than having a person to person talk. What is important is that we need to look into the inner side of their minds through what they tell you. Their stories may be all similar to one another, but I know now that their intentions beneath it are all different from one another in light of the previous experiences, places and complex interaction of circumstances. **B** strongly felt that it was not right to judge or criticize easily the experiences of others in order to communicate with the mind of others.

She has been seriously thinking about honesty these days. "If I can be honest with my thoughts, feelings, words and emotions, it is a quicker way to become true to myself." (B, personal journal, p. 1). "B thinks that she has to be honest with her feelings and emotions in order to touch the client's feelings and emotions sensitively and accept them for what they are. B very much appreciates that she learns the person-centered counseling from A, who has professional knowledge and pursues a deeper perspective on counseling. Her strictness on her studies and warm heart for her students are the basis of the strength that she is able to stand still as a true counselor with the person-centered approach. Below is how B describes her relationship with A which is beyond one between a professor and a student or a teacher or a learner of the person-centered counseling:

"Whenever I meet A, she is humorous, enthusiastic and gets excited like a child. I feel a desire to go back to my old days where I like flowers, tofu, children, music, chanting and parties, and where I solve my problems by myself without worrying about others. I hope to live my life full of fun as honestly as possible every moment like A does. These days, I feel happy and am not lonely anymore (B, Interview, p. 16)."

C. Supervision class story

The stories mentioned above so far are about building a relationship between A and B as sisters or friends rather than a simple relationship of a professor and a student. This section provides a description of relationship building as a teacher and a student in the internship.

The supervision classes normally include sharing with a supervisor and other potential supervisees a transcript which shows what happened in the counseling scenes by a supervisee. However, A treats

the supervision classes for the supervisees to be ready to obtain effectively the knowledge and experience required for counseling practices. Such supervision program stems from A's life. A believes that a counselor has to keep going with research, counseling and self-analysis and she has lived her life on such a track. An integrated education for research studies, counseling and self analysis can be said to be a much more effective way of connecting closely the relevant theories and practice than just simply going through supervision cases. B mentions the effect of an supervision as below:

"The essentials of supervision exist where it is not only about getting feedback from the supervisor, but also getting personal counseling all together. This is true in that whenever I have unsolved problems which happen to come out during counseling my clients, I take a closer look at them by self analysis. That is to say, there are no boundaries between supervision and self analysis and consequently it is easier to understand at which part I went wrong. My personality has changed once again from when I focused on my first research with your (Researcher C) assistance and support. (Omitted) I was able to get away a little bit from the fear I had as a beginner counselor (B, Interview, p. 5). (Omitted) Unlike other supervisors who only provide directions in counseling, A listens to what we have in our verbatim report and gives support. She first tries to understand what we had to say in counseling and then she provides us with her feedback. It is rather like a brainstorming session as we can feel free to share our views with A. This means that we don't need to feel bad while having supervisions. It is a real 'Rogerian' attitude. If it was another supervisor, I might have felt offended. I once actually felt offended. As I wrote in my personal journal, a supervisor who didn't even know me well told me I seemed

conservative. I got furious at that time (B, Interview, p. 24).”

Having an insight through self introspection may be the same as objectifying each set of one’s values and stereotypes. Objectifying oneself may be the same as keeping a certain distance from relationships or situations around oneself with a healthy mind. Keeping a healthy distance plays a significant role in actual counseling scenes as well as for us. If someone gives you a hard time, **B** learned to have the courage to say to him/her “It is your problem, not mine” (B, Personal journal, p. 1)“ through self-introspection. As such, keeping a certain distance from a situation helps a lot in an actual counseling scene. If there is a client who is worried about a problem, a counselor needs to listen to the client and to know language to express the client’s exact mind. If a counselor fails to keep a certain distance from the situation, the counselor would have a limited ability to read the client’s mind. This is what **A** taught. **B** shared her experience in relation to such feedback in her personal counseling transcription record. Below is what **B** realized naturally while **A** provided feedback.

“I(B) felt uneasy after I got such feedback. I asked myself why can’t I say what the client wants to say on the client’s behalf. I thought to myself I might have tried to look cultivated and neat! It made me to say not what I really wanted to say, but put it in a nicer way. Then the client didn’t know what my point was and I felt heavy and tired... I tried to look cultivated and neat also in my counseling scenes. I tried not to accept my anger and difficulties in me. It resulted in setting a rule of my own and I never said anything more to show my real feelings. Such reaction may stem from the fear that people may disregard me. I was too proud to believe a person can become perfect. I witnessed my arrogance during my meditation (B, Counseling transcription record, pp.

5-6).”

“**A** says it is my understanding that supervision is there for me to realize my strengths and weaknesses and improve my ability in counseling. But, even though it gives me a chance to improve my weaknesses, it would hurt my feelings if I feel I failed to gain my trust as a counselor if I heard when **A** says, why you(**A**) said this and that, this is bad. It’s because I am not ready yet to hear such feedback. However, **A** knows when to stop and what to mention when I get feedback from **A** (B, Interview, pp. 25-26).”

A starts with compliments and then she deals with my issues to be solved. Then **A** goes to the next step. One time, **B** remembered **A** said that **A** had different approaches to provide feedback depending on the levels of the counselors. That means **A** really knows the supervisees through the times she had with them in their self analysis etc. So, it is only natural for **A** to know what **A** has to do when **A** deals with her clients’ issues.

“One of the differences of A’s the class is that if we happen to overhear A’s class at the door, we can hear nothing but laughter. We laugh a lot during supervision classes. **A** said I needed to show my clients the right model as well as empathic understanding. I didn’t understand it at the time. But I have now understood it through my supervision internship course. So I tend to do what **A** showed me in my counseling session. (Omitted) I cannot feel any sense of authority in **A** as a supervisor. I felt **A** really understood me (B, Interview, pp. 26-27).”

4. Re-telling the story

After having read what they had to say about what they experienced as a counselor, which was written in a narrative way, there have been a lot of changes and understanding of oneself and circumstances. **B** said

that she felt her life had been all straightened out and realized why she started studying counseling psychology after having read her own stories. Also, **A** said she felt as if she had become a client and she again realized how important the genuineness of a counselor was, (Roger's) having shared each other's own experiences. Unconditional positive regard and building trust helped **B** try to share her experiences with **A**. Having read the narrative, **B** felt empathy with **A**'s feelings which she had when she got back from the US, having recalled her experience when she had to choose childhood education for her major. Through the narrative, the researchers **A**, **B** and **C** all shared their experiences of unhappy periods of their lives when they couldn't make it to one of the top universities in Korea or they couldn't choose their majors with much freedom. They once had and still have a scar in them caused by Korean societal problems in this society in which one's life is decided by the age of 19 by their final CSAT score. When all three researchers had a meeting to have a storytelling once more, they built much stronger mutual trust sharing the same pain:

"In my old days when I went to the US, it was not my decision and I wasn't ready. But I was sent to the US anyway and I had to come back to Korea again only to find out I had to enter the university that I didn't want to. I strongly felt from my heart that I was resisting the situations surrounding me, where I was struggling to find my own life and my own spirit at the university that I didn't want to enter and where I felt against the qualifications demanded by the society (A, Interview, p. 1)."

A and **B** have different perspectives on the life of a mother who is commonly called as "*Ah-zum-ma*" in Korea. It is hard for **B** to imagine her life without her husband and children.

"I am not at all different compared with all other

mothers in Korea who are used to the traditional Korean culture and education. I am always ready to make sacrifices for my husband and children. It was not easy for me to insist upon being real myself, but I had a chance to have valuable time to look back on my life (B, Interview, p. 7)."

On the contrary, **A** considers her professional career as a counseling psychologist equally important in her life as her personal life as a wife or a mother. **A** was afraid that she failed to accept **B** as she was when **B** was her graduate student and she couldn't pay unconditional positive regard to **B** as her professor or professional counselor. The below is an extract from **A**'s storytelling once more.

"When **B** had a difficult time with her master degree dissertation, I still question myself whether I showed enough empathy to deal with her difficult time, whether I gave her enough time to look back on the situation where she couldn't help to push her clients to find their identities due to **B**'s own issues, or whether I showed enough empathy with her passive attitude...(A, Interview, p. 12)."

The professor and student relationships in Korean culture is more vertical relations than horizontal. Therefore, students can't dare to talk about their stories and they even get very cautious. **B** didn't mention any of her feelings, opinions, questions or detailed feedback. She kept them only to herself. She was very careful whenever she expressed her feelings or opinions. She confessed that she tended to accept any feedback on training without criticism or analysis since she thought that she still had a lot to learn and she had fear in her for a lack of her ability to do well in counseling. However, **A**'s unconditional positive regard has made **B** share more of her feelings and thoughts with the members of the knowledge community than before. As **B** mentioned before, self disclosure is scary and their life

experiences, storytelling once more and living and living again, shall continue only in a safe place where one has trust and acceptance. Also, it is what it is to become a real self as Rogers mentioned[22].

V. Discussion

This research examines the personal relationship in the lives of **A** and **B** as a supervisor and a supervisee in a supervision program through the lens of three dimensional narrative inquiry. The speakers and their life stories play the core roles in this research. Supervisor **A** had culture shock after she got back from the US in her school years and such culture shock affected very much her role as a supervisor and teacher and also the relationship with Supervisee **B**. Affected by Korean culture, **B** felt she was forced to live her life as a wife and a mother rather than live her own life as a person. Such an attitude toward her life affected relationship building with **A** in supervision directly and indirectly.

The description of the process of building such a relationship was done through the lens where time, space and interrelation are related to each other. During the supervision program, they tried to describe their present stories throughout the supervision program by sharing the stories of their childhood, adolescence and university lives. At the same time, their stories moved to the place where they had their experiences. Some stories describe a life in Jeju Island or a life abroad and move to the present time in Korea where the university is and where they live their lives. Lastly, the stories which are woven by time and places prove that **A** and **B** continue to interact with the situations surrounding them and such interaction became the plots of their own stories. Also, such plots provide a chance to

confirm things they have in common and it leads them to build a relationship of sisters which is above that of a teacher and a student or of a supervisor and a supervisee.

Several points can be discussed. First, we need to explore the possibility of the different perspectives on a supervision relationship: one vertical, the other horizontal. According to **B**'s report, we can see her relationship with **A** moves towards the horizontal relations. Choi & Kim suggested that "the level of verticality-horizontality reflect the structure of authority"[18]. Holloway[19] considered that a relationship in supervision is a level of power and involvement and the various roles of a supervisor which include a teacher, a counselor and an advisor may depend upon the distribution of power[4]. That is to say, it is understood that a relationship is vertical when a supervisor plays a role as a mentor and a teacher while the relationship is horizontal when a supervisor plays a role as a counselor or an advisor. "While the skilled supervisee in Korea consider a relationship in which a supervisor plays a role as a teacher or respectful senior positive"[18], in western countries, the more experience the counselors have, the more horizontal supervision relations are likely to develop[20]. We can assume that such a result may stem from the fact that Korean culture highly regards hierarchical relations and stresses professional authority[21]. According to research regarding skilled Korean counselors, the more horizontal the relationship is the more effective the relationship of counseling is[21]. If there is an assumption that the supervision relationships are similar to those of counseling, we also can conclude that the more horizontal the relationship is the more effective the supervision is. Further studies need to carry out more profound research studies in the future on this issue.

Secondly, it is an issue of genuineness and

openness. The genuineness and openness of a supervisor and a supervisee are the core factors of a person-centered counseling approach[22]. Especially, the genuineness and openness of a supervisor plays a significant role in building a relationship with a supervisee. Seong-Hee Son [23] believed that one of the phenomena happening to a supervisee in supervision is self closure against their supervisor and researched that issue. According to his research, the reasons for such phenomenon include (1) expectations of hierarchical relationship towards the supervisors or conflicts between them; (2) the fact that they have difficulties in expressing their own feelings, responses and thoughts on the experiences that they had during supervision. Also, it is reported that the most common way of self closure is 'concealment' through which they can perfectly omit, hide, delete or conceal their feelings and thoughts and the rate of supervisees who use such 'concealment' reached 68.8% among all responded supervisees.

Such concealment may be an obstacle to becoming a professional counselor who has necessary knowledge and experiences and also it can be very dangerous to potential clients in the future. If there is not enough discussion between a supervisor and a supervisee regarding many parts of the counseling scenes, the supervisees would certainly lack the capability and attitudes to become a qualified counselor. It is assumed that the eastern culture has a strong view of vertical relations in supervision and also consider more important how one would look in the eyes of others rather than what one really is. However, the level of concealment by a supervisee can be said to depend upon the rapport built with supervisors and self disclosure or attitude of supervisors.

As shown in this research, **A** tried to provide **B** her unconditional positive regard and finally succeeded to

build a rapport with her effort to disregard the hierarchy melt in Korean culture and power as an authority. It has been proved that the unconditional positive regard of a supervisor allows supervisee who tends to use concealment due to vertical relations to easily show their thoughts, opinions, views and emotions during their self analysis with transcripts. The results of this study provides the possibility of having different perspective in supervision relationship. The vertical relations in supervision asserted by the existing studies is caused by a cultural factor. It is given that supervisee does not want to, but if the supervisors take the initiative and set an example in making such an environment of acceptance and trust, the supervisee can take an active part in supervision. Then the relationship in supervision can develop from a vertical one to a horizontal one.

Thus, if a relationship in supervision is to be built with trust based on unconditional positive regard by a supervisor, the supervisee will have much freedom in self disclosure. Such freedom can be achieved by sharing counseling knowledge, methods and many stories from counseling practices. Once a certain number of members with professional knowledge share narratives of their knowledge and experiences, it forms a professional counseling-culture group as a knowledge community.

Thirdly, it is about education in supervision. Seong-Hee Sohn[23] has asserted that the trainees take supervision for their future practices and growth as a counselor for the purpose of training for counselor's skills and efficacy development, assessment of counseling professionalism and protection for clients, and it can give them an opportunity to verify the experiences that they had during supervision" (p.57). Further development in professionalism has become a pending issue in the

Korean counseling field and this issue is closely related to the need for systematic education by counselors with a certain level[24].

Counseling supervision plays an important role in producing a professional counselor[25]. Then, what would be the meaning of education in the person-centered supervision? Education means experiences which can be obtained in a question of what is a human being, relationships between them and a relationship with their continuously interacting environment[13]. Especially, according to Dewey[26], what we experience in our lives is the same meaning as having education and thus, we need to realize that education, life and experience do not exist separately, but exist as a whole. Rogers was also against education which separates thinking from feeling of a human being and puts the learners in the center of education. He said that is an ideal situation for education is when students choose themselves what they like to learn and learn with their own responsibilities rather than where they can get limited knowledge or learn existing culture provided in certain textbooks. In order to achieve such education, the teachers, first, have to be ready to have an attitude of a coordinator and learner who is willing to cooperate and learn with students rather than professionals only with certain knowledge. Secondly, they have to change their mindset from an idea of giving and delivering their knowledge unilaterally to an idea of sharing their knowledge with students. Lastly, he asserted that teachers need to disclose themselves as a person like their students rather than asserting their authority[27]. This means that we need to make an atmosphere where we can feel free to speak about our feelings and thoughts without pressure or stress. We feel it necessary to carry out a profound study on how we can arrange in reality the supervision environment which helps the

supervisees' growth as a learner.

Lastly, two researchers in this research are also participants and they have a relationship of a professor and a student. This means that they are standing in the middle of a field where a person lives and experiences, so it is not all easy for me to disclose their inner selves within Korean culture. We'd like to say - for the record- that the research outcome under such circumstances has its limit to apply in general in light of objectivity and honesty.

However, objectivity and honesty need to be understood within a certain case. It is only natural to think carefully 'who would be the most appropriate and desirable person?' The researchers would like to come to a conclusion with a careful answer 'it can be the one who shares the stories.' It is because the person can deliver his/her stories more vividly when the person is the one who experienced it. The relationship between the two participants and researchers in this research can be considered one above a relationship of a professor and a student. The stories drawn from their newly built relationship can certainly be one specific case which has obtained objectivity and honesty more than any other research, but it needs to be warned when the result is to be generalized to other cases.

* The author would like to thank Joo Young Kim and Kyung Moon Park (Duksung Women's University) for their contribution of this study.

참 고 문 헌

- [1] C. E. Hill, D. Charlers, and K. G. Reed, "A longitudinal analysis of changes in counseling skills during doctoral training in counseling psychology," *Journal of Counseling Psychology*,

- Vol.28, pp.428-436, 1981.
- [2] R. L. Haynes, G. F. Corey, and P. Moulton, Clinical supervision in the helping professions: a practical guide (C. Kim, S. Yoo, H. Kim & H. Choi Trans), Seoul: Sigmampress(origin 2003), 2006.
- [3] K. Park and T. Kim, "Narrative Inquiry: Practical experience of an Introduction to Engineering," Korean Institute of Industrial Education, Vol.34, No.2, pp.128-160, 2009.
- [4] J. M. Bernard and R. K. Goodyear, *Fundamentals of clinical supervision (3rd ed.)* Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon, 2003.
- [5] G. Corey, M. S. Corey, and P. Callanan, *Issues and ethics in the helping professions(6th ed.)*, Pacific Grove, CA: Brooks/Cole., 200.
- [6] G. Yontef, *Supervision from a Gestalt perspective*, In E. Watkins, (Ed.), *Handbook of psychotherapy supervision* New York: John Wiley & Sons, pp.147-163, 1997.
- [7] M. S. Carifio and A. K. Hess, "Who is the ideal supervisor?," *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, Vol.18, No.3, pp.244-250, 1987.
- [8] E. Lambers, Supervision on a person-centered therapy: Facilitating congruence, In E. Mearns & B. Thome (Eds.), *Person-centered therapy today: New frontiers in theory and practice*, London: Sage, pp.196-211, 2000.
- [9] D. S. Davenport, "Ethical and legal problems with client-centered supervision," *Counselor Education and Supervision*, Vol.31, pp.227-231, 1992.
- [10] E. L. Worthington and H. J. Roehlke, "Effective supervision as perceived by beginning counselors-in-training," *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, Vol.26, pp.64-73, 1979.
- [11] A. A. Krause and G. J. Allen, "Perception of counselor supervision: An examination of Stotenberg's model from the perspective of supervisor and supervisee," *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, Vol.35, pp.77-80, 1988.
- [12] D. E. Polkinghorne, *Narrative Knowing and the Human Sciences*, Albany: State University of New York Press., 1988.
- [13] D. J. Clandinin and F. M. Connelly, *Narrative Inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research*, CA: Jossey-Bass., 2000.
- [14] K. Park, *Being eastern on a western educational landscape*, Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Houston, Houston, Texas, U.S. 2006.
- [15] F. M. Connelly and D. J. Clandinin, "Stories of experience and narrative inquiry," *Educational Research*, Vol.19, No.5, pp.2-14, 1990.
- [16] C. J. Craig, "School portfolio development: A teacher knowledge approach," *Journal of Teacher Education*, Vol.54, No.2, pp.122-134, 2003.
- [17] C. J. Craig, "Shifting boundaries on the professional knowledge landscape: When teacher communications become less safe," *Curriculum Inquiry*, Vol.34, No.4, pp.395-423, 2004.
- [18] H. N. Choi and C. D. Kim, "The Dimensionality of Supervisees' Perceptions of a Good Supervisory Relationship," *The Korean Journal of Counseling and Psychotherapy*, Vol.20, No.1, pp.1-21, 2008.
- [19] E. L. Holloway, Structures for the analysis and teaching of psychotherapy, In C. E. Watkins, (Eds.), *Handbook of psychotherapy supervision* New York: Wiley, pp.249-276, 1997.
- [20] C. D. Stoltenberg and U. Delworth, *Supervising counselors and therapists*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1987.
- [21] E. Joo, "Counselors in South Korea: A

- qualitative study of senior professionals,”
Journal of Counseling and Development, Vol.87,
No.4, pp.466-475, 2009.
- [22] C. Rogers, On Becoming a Person- A
Therapist’s View of Psychotherapy (Joo, E.
Trans.), Seoul: Hakjisa(origin 1961), 2009.
- [23] S. Sohn, “Supervisees’ Nondisclosure in
Counseling Supervision,” The Korean Journal of
Counseling and Psychotherapy, Vol.17, No.1,
pp.57-74, 2005.
- [24] E. Song and N. Chung, “A Study of
Supervision Educational Contents Needs, Actual
Condition and Satisfaction,” The Korean Journal
of Counseling and Psychtherapy, Vol.17, No.2,
pp.317-334, 2005.
- [25] C. Loganbil, E. Hardy, and U. Delworth,
“Supervision: A conceptual model,” The
Counseling Psychologist, Vol.10, pp.3-42, 1982.
- [26] J. Dewey, *Experience & education*, New York:
Simon & Schuster, (1938/1997).
- [27] C. Rogers, *Freedom to Learn (Yean M.
Trans.)*, Seoul: Munumsa. (origin 1969), 1992.

저 자 소 개

주 은 선(Eunsun Joo)

정회원



- 1997년 : 미 Chicago 대(박사)
- 1993년 : 미 Chicago 대(석사)
- 1998년 ~ 현재 : 덕성여자대학교
심리학과 교수

<관심분야> : 상담과 문화, 상담자 발달, 인간중심과
포커싱, 슈퍼비전