

A Comparison of Korean EFL Learners' Oral and Written Productions

Eunha Lee
(Shinheung College)

Lee, Eunha. (2006). A comparison of Korean EFL learners' oral and written productions. *English Language & Literature Teaching*, 12(2), 61-85.

The purpose of the present study is to compare Korean EFL learners' speech corpus (i.e. oral productions) with their composition corpus (i.e. written productions). Four college students participated in the study. The composition corpus was collected through a writing assignment, and the speech corpus was gathered by audio-taping their oral presentations. The results of the data analysis indicate that (i) As for error frequency, young adult low-intermediate Korean EFL learners showed high frequency in determiners (mostly, indefinite articles), vocabulary (mostly, semantic errors), and prepositions. The frequency order did not show much difference between the speech corpus and the composition corpus; and (ii) When comparing the oral productions with the written productions, there were not many differences between them in terms of the contents, a style (i.e., colloquial vs. literary), vocabulary selection, and error types and frequency. Therefore, it is assumed that the proficiency in oral presentation of EFL learners at this learning stage heavily depends on how much/how well they are able to write. In other words, EFL learners' writing and speaking skills are closely co-related. It implies that the teacher does not need to separate teaching how to speak from teaching how to write. The teacher may use the same methods or strategies to help the learners improve their English speaking and writing skills. Furthermore, it will be more effective to teach writing before speaking since they have more opportunities to write than speak in the EFL contexts.

[speech corpus/composition corpus/error frequency/frequency order]

I. INTRODUCTION

Language learners make errors in both comprehension (listening, reading) and production (speaking, writing). As Corder (1974) has pointed out, comprehension errors have received scant attention compared with production errors because it is very difficult to assign the cause of failures of comprehension to an inadequate knowledge of a particular syntactic feature of a misunderstood utterance. Production errors are the flawed side of learner speech or writing. They are those parts of conversation or composition that deviate from some selected norm of mature language performance. Many studies in Korea have been done to investigate Korean EFL learners' production errors rather than comprehension errors. As for EA studies on productive skills, most of them were based on the composition corpus (e.g., entitled "A study on Korean EFL learners' composition errors and its educational implications") whereas EA research on oral productions is rarely found. Even though both writing and speaking are productive skills, EFL learners might show different proficiency/progresses in both skills. Therefore, it is important to investigate characteristics/comparison of the two language skills at a certain developmental stage. The present study examines the same subjects' oral and written productions in order to compare the two and find out similarities/differences between them.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

One of the most recent studies on Korean EFL learners' written production is found in D. Shin (2001)'s doctoral dissertation. In the study, she examined 20 first-year Korean undergraduates' written productions in order to investigate Korean learners' L2 performance and the effect of formal instruction, and 40 subjects' oral productions to identify phonological problems by asking them to read one unit of the English textbook. The results from the analysis of the written task revealed that the syntactically different SVO target language rules were well-formed in the subjects' English diaries, but the complex English morphemes impeded most of the subjects' accurate L2 performance. Also, she concluded that form-focused classroom

instruction did not significantly help the students use the correct L2 rules, and their prior knowledge of L1 and developmental patterns still remained unchanged within their interlanguage¹⁾ systems in applying the correct rules of L2 morphologies.

S. Shin's study (2002) was designed to evaluate and analyze TWE (Test of Written English) 226 college students from 4 different universities in Seoul had taken. Her research showed that Korean EFL learners made most errors in articles, selection of a word, and agreement. She concluded that the errors were mostly caused by L1 transfer, and especially, the learners had difficulty in using articles since their L1 (Korean) grammar did not have rules for articles.

Kim's study (1997) on the errors and intelligibility of Korean college students' utterances provided an analysis of speech errors made by 15 Korean college students (juniors) majoring in English. Each of them was asked to orally summarize an English novel they were familiar with for 10 minutes. The result showed that the subjects made the most errors in grammatical forms (33.3%), articles (24.2%) followed by tense (17.3%), vocabulary (11.1%), prepositions (8.1%), others (3.8%), word order (0.9%), structure (0.8%), and auxiliaries (0.5%).

H. Shin (2002) analyzed speech samples spoken by Korean EFL learners on the SMU-MATE Speaking Test.²⁾ The subjects were 20 moderate level³⁾ college students. Each subject's speech samples were 22 answers, which means 440 answers in all.⁴⁾ Out of 440 spoken answers 1,793 errors were identified, and the most common ones were articles (386;22%), verbs and tense (354;20%), prepositions(233;13%), whereas the least common ones were semantic errors by using adopted words (65;4%) and

¹⁾ 'Interlanguage' refers to the systematic knowledge of an L2 which is independent of both the learner's L1 and the target language.

²⁾ SMU-MATE (Sookmyung Women's Univ. Multi-media Assisted Test of English) is designed to measure global speaking competence of Korean EFL learners in real-life-like situations (van Vlack, 2002).

³⁾ The test is composed of four levels depending on English proficiency (i.e., rudimentary levels, moderate levels, commanding levels, and expert levels). According to the MATE proficiency guideline (van Vlack, 2002), moderate level speakers are able to communicate their basic needs and wants.

⁴⁾ Sample questions in the MATE:

1. Personal questions : What would you like to do in you free time?; Tell my about your family.
2. Respond to each statement/question: Oh, I love this painting; I'm so excited. I have two weeks off.
3. Picture description: Can you tell me what the room looks like?

case (73;4%). As for error source, interlingual errors were 44% (792) and in that proportion the subjects had difficulties in dealing with word choice, articles, and S-V agreement.

Based on several EA studies reviewed above, some similarities are found between Korean EFL learners' oral and written productions. First of all, generally speaking, Korean EFL learners have difficulty in using articles and complex English morphemes such as tense, S-V agreement, and plural -s. Secondly, they frequently rely on their L1 in producing L2. Finally, the teacher should focus on correcting errors which greatly influence the overall intelligibility as far as the purpose of language teaching is to have the learners successfully communicate in the target language.

However, not many EA studies on the corpus of spoken language are found in Korea as well as in studies conducted abroad. Therefore, future EA research needs to focus on Korean EFL learners' oral production. In addition, the similarities/differences between written and oral productions produced by the "same" learners need to be investigated.

III. METHODS

1. Subjects

The subjects in the study are Korean college students learning EFL. They are quite homogeneous in that they are similar in age and currently enrolled in the same school having a similar previous learning experience (i.e., having learned English for 6 years in the classroom settings not naturalistic environments). The class consists of forty students, and for the present study, four students are selected based on the test result (i.e., simulated TOEIC exam: The subjects' scores range from 400 to 465.). The result of the simulated TOEIC indicates that they are low-intermediate in terms of English proficiency (Their mean score of the TOEIC exam belongs to Level D⁵⁾). The four

⁵⁾ The guide provided by ETS suggests the relationship between a test-taker's communication skill and his/her TOEIC score. The test takers are divided into five groups according to their scores as following;

students' oral and written productions are examined for the analysis. Table 1 shows the TOEIC scores of the subjects.

TABLE 1
Subjects' TOEIC Scores

Subject	TOEIC score (simulated)
1	465
2	455
3	410
4	400

2. Procedures

In order to get composition and speech corpus, data was collected in two different ways. Composition corpus (i.e., written productions) was collected by asking them to write a free composition. The topic assigned was "Write about yourself including your family, schooling, hobbies, and you in 10 years." Collection for speech corpus (i.e., oral productions⁶⁾) was carried out through group interviews (groups of five persons). Each group member was asked to introduce himself/herself. The students' oral productions were tape-recorded to be transcribed. They had one week to be prepared for the two tasks. All the errors identified in the subjects' data were classified, divided into three categories; morphology, syntax, and others.

Level A: Score of 860 or more

Level B: Score of 730-855

Level C: Score of 470-725

Level D: Score of 220-465

Level E: Score of 220 or less

⁶⁾ Learners do not produce much spontaneous data in the EFL context. Especially, in case of oral productions, they usually write before they speak. Therefore, the speech corpus (i.e., the oral productions) presented in this study is more like "recall" or "recitation" from the written work rather than instant utterances.

IV. RESULTS

The error types and examples of the four subjects are provided in this section. Table 2 indicates all the errors identified in Subject 1 (S1)'s oral and written productions followed by Table 2-1 showing the number of errors in each category. S1 was one of the outstanding students in the class (He was very confident in speaking, and his simulated TOEIC score was high compared with other students in the class). Nevertheless, he also made many errors in determiners (use of articles and possessives). Articles, one of the elements which are most frequently used to complete an English sentence, seem to be troublesome to Korean EFL learners because their native language has no rules for indefinite articles.

TABLE 2
Errors in S1's Productions

error type & example	
oral	written
<i>A. Morphology</i> 1. Indefinite article incorrect - I want to be <u>a</u> international lawyer or a translator. (an international....)	<i>A. Morphology</i> 1. Indefinite articles incorrect - I want to be <u>a</u> international lawyer or a translator.
<i>B. Syntax</i> 1. VP (1) tense - My parents <u>carrying on</u> a kindergarten, and an older brother studying Chinese in China. (carry on... study...)	<i>B. Syntax</i> 1. VP (1) tense - Parent both <u>are working</u> in a kindergarten. (work) (2) verb usage a. a causative verb - I will complete my own poem about my life that can <u>make people's sympathies</u> . (make people sympathize about)

<p>2. NP</p> <p>(1) number</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My family are all <u>christian</u>. - I want to have a <u>two professional job</u>. (two professional jobs) <p>(2) determiners</p> <p>a. use of possessive</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - One is for <u>my</u> money, and the other is for <u>my</u> life (for money for pleasure) <p>b. articles</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ... rapping with ___ bit-box. (a) <p>(3) NP/subj. omission</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My family consists of 5 ___. (people) <p>3. Prepositions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Thanks for listening ___ my introduction. (to) 	<p>(3) omission of verb</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I ___ certain that I have very high passion about English. <p>(4) addition of verb</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I <u>was</u> graduated from Soongduk elementary school. <p>2. NP</p> <p>(1) number</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <u>Parent</u> both are working in a kindergarten. (parents) <p>(2) determiners</p> <p>a. articles incorrect (addition, omission)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I want to have two professional jobs. One is <u>for the money...</u> (for money) - This is ___ end of my introduction. (...the end...) - I want to be a real 'MC' that means ___ 'rapper'. (a rapper) <p>b. use of possessive</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - For <u>my</u> money, I want to be a international lawyer or a translator. (for money) <p>(3) NP/subj. omission</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My family consists of 5 ___. (people) <p>3. Prepositions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I want to talk ___ many things with you. (about...)
<p><i>C. Others</i></p> <p>1. Vocabulary</p> <p>(1) semantic errors</p> <p>a. mis-selection of vocabulary</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This is <u>three times</u> that I tell you guys about my dream. (third time) - One is for my money, and the other is <u>for my life</u> (...for pleasure) 	<p><i>C. Others</i></p> <p>1. Vocabulary</p> <p>(1) semantic errors</p> <p>a. mis-selection of vocabulary</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - One is for my money, and the other is <u>for my life</u>. (.....for pleasure)

2. Simple omission - I'm studying in ____ English interpretation. (the dept.)	
---	--

TABLE 2-1
The Number of Errors

Linguistic category	Oral	No.	Written	No.
Morphology [1 ⁷⁾ / 1 ⁸⁾]	indefinite article	1	indefinite article	1
Syntax[7/11]	VP:		VP:	
	tense	1	tense	1
	verb usage	0	verb usage	1
	omission of verb	0	omission of verb	1
	addition of verb	0	addition of verb	1
	NP:		NP:	
	number	2	number	1
	determiners	2	determiners	4
	NP/subj. omission	1	NP/subj. omission	1
	Prepositions	1	Prepositions	1
	Simple omission	1	Simple omission	0
Others[3/1]	Vocabulary:		Vocabulary:	
	semantic errors	2	semantic errors	1

Table 3 shows all the errors identified in Subject 2 (S2)'s oral and written productions and Table 3-1 presents the number of errors in each category. S2's L2 productions were very short, and therefore not many errors were identified. Errors were mostly made in NP.

⁷⁾ The number indicates the total number of speech errors found in the category.

⁸⁾ The number indicates the total number of composition errors found in the category.

TABLE 3
Errors in S2's Productions

error type & example	
oral	written
<i>A. Morphology</i> (not found)	<i>A. Morphology</i> (not found)
<i>B. Syntax</i> 1. NP (1) NP/subj. omission - My family consists of 3 ____. (2) nominalization - My hobby is <u>play</u> games online. (3) use of pronouns (alternating use of pronouns by number or gender) - I spend my evenings playing <u>it</u> . (referring to 'computer games').	<i>B. Syntax</i> 1. NP (1) NP/subj. omission - My family consists of 3 ____. (2) nominalization - My hobby is <u>play</u> games online. (3) use of pronouns (alternating use of pronouns by number or gender) - I spend my evenings playing <u>it</u> (referring to 'computer games'). 2. VP (1) tense - I feel that I <u>should study</u> English earlier. (should have studied) 3. Use of prepositions - I've been lazy <u>on</u> that. (with)
<i>C. Others</i> 1. Vocabulary (1) parts of speech mis-selected - That's why I decided to <u>choice</u> this department ⁹⁾ .	<i>C. Others</i> 1. Vocabulary (1) parts of speech mis-selected - That's why I decided to <u>choice</u> this department.

⁹⁾ This error is rather ambiguous to decide its error type. After reviewing his oral/written data, I decided to put it into 'Others' because he seemed to be aware of the syntactic structure of 'to infinitive'. This decision was made based on the following sentences he produced: (i) I want to gain self confidence... and (ii) I made up my mind to start learning English. Therefore, it is assumed that he is aware of the fact that 'to' is followed by 'a verb' not 'a noun'. He seems to consider 'choice' as a verb.

TALE 3-1
The Number of Errors

Linguistic category	Oral	No.	Written	No.
Morphology[0/0]		0		0
Syntax[3/5]	NP:		NP:	
	NP/subj. omission	1	NP/subj. omission	1
	nominalization	1	nominalization	1
	use of pronouns	1	use of pronouns	1
	Prepositions	0	Prepositions	1
	VP:		VP:	
Others[1/1]	tense	0	tense	1
	Vocabulary:		Vocabulary:	
	parts of speech	1	parts of speech	1

All the errors identified in Subject 3 (S3)'s oral and written productions are categorized in Table 4, followed by Table 4-1 presenting the number of errors in each category. His oral presentation was much shorter than his written work, which resulted from lack of confidence, and accordingly the number of errors in the oral presentation was much less than the written work. The errors are most frequently found in use of vocabulary (semantic errors).

TABLE 4
Errors in S3's Productions

error type & example	
oral	written
<i>A. Morphology</i> (not found)	<i>A. Morphology</i> (not found)
<i>B. Syntax</i> 1. Prepositions - My birthday is <u>July 25 in 1985</u> . (July 25, 1985)	<i>B. Syntax</i> 1. Prepositions - <u>on the sungbukgu</u> in 2004. (in Sunbukgu) - Therefore I set up <u>a shop to PC-room</u> . (a shop, PC-room)

<p>2. NP</p> <p>(1) determiners (articles)</p> <p>- My hobbies are reading books, watching <u>movie</u> and playing soccer. (a movie)</p> <p>(2) number</p> <p>- My special abilities are sports and <u>game</u>. (games)</p> <p>3. VP</p> <p>(1) S-V agreement</p> <p>- I'm trying to live as the Bible <u>say</u>.</p>	<p>2. NP</p> <p>(1) nominalization</p> <p>- My hobbies are reading books, playing soccer and <u>watch</u> movies.</p> <p>(2) NP/subj. omission</p> <p>- First of all, ___ go to army as a petty officer. (I will)</p> <p>- And then there ___ raise the funds. (I will)</p> <p>(3) determiners</p> <p>a. omission of possessives</p> <p>- ___ Father is 50 old man, ___ mother is 45 old woman...</p> <p>b. omission of indefinite articles</p> <p>- Father is ___ 50 old man, mother is ___ 45 old woman...</p> <p>3. VP</p> <p>(1) verb usage</p> <p>a. voicing</p> <p>- I <u>admit</u> into shinhung university in 2004. (was admitted)</p> <p>(2) omission of verb</p> <p>- ... and I ___ at age 20.</p> <p>(3) tense</p> <p>- Therefore I <u>set up</u> a shop to PC room. (will set up)</p> <p>(4) addition of verb</p> <p>- I <u>am</u> graduated from kangbuk middle school in 2002 and youngmun high school on the sungbukgu in 2004.</p> <p>4. Word order</p> <p>- Because red is strongly sensation give me. (Because red gives me a strong sensation.)</p> <p>- This is <u>naivety my dream</u>. (my naive dream)</p> <p>5. Conjunctions</p> <p>- Father is 50 old man, ___ mother is 45 old woman. (and)</p>
---	--

<p><i>C. Others</i></p> <p>1. Vocabulary</p> <p>(1) semantic errors</p> <p>a. overextension of the meaning</p> <p>- Because red <u>is</u> strong. (stands for/looks)</p>	<p><i>C. Others</i></p> <p>1. Vocabulary</p> <p>(1) semantic errors</p> <p>a. mis-selection of vocabulary</p> <p>- I <u>volunteer...</u> (applied for)</p> <p>- ... the English language interpreting <u>class</u>. (.....dept.)</p> <p>- go to army as <u>a petty officer</u>...</p> <p>- and then there <u>raise the funds</u>... (save money)</p> <p>- <u>Therefore</u> I set up a shop... (After that/Then)</p> <p>b. overextension of the meaning</p> <p>- My family <u>is</u> father, mother and me. (consists of)</p> <p>- My dream <u>is</u> humdrum life. (... is to lead a humdrum life)</p> <p>(2) parts of speech mis-selected</p> <p>- Because red is <u>strongly</u> sensation give me.</p> <p>2. Simple omission</p> <p>- Father is 50 ___ old man, mother is 45 ___ old woman... (year)</p> <p>3. Awkward expressions</p> <p>- I do reading books in large part.</p>
--	--

TABLE 4-1
The Number of Errors

Linguistic category	Oral	No.	Written	No.
Morphology[0/0]		0		0
Syntax[4/14]	Prepositions	1	Prepositions	2
	Conjunctions	0	Conjunctions	1
	NP		NP:	
	determiners(articles)	1	determiners(articles)	2
	number	1	number	0
	nominalization	0	nominalization	1
	NP/subj. omission	0	NP/subj. omission	2

	VP:		VP:	
	verb usage	0	verb usage	1
	omission of verb	0	omission of verb	1
	addition of verb	0	addition of verb	1
	tense	0	tense	1
	S-V disagreement	1	S-V disagreement	0
	Word order	0	Word order	2
	Vocabulary:		Vocabulary:	
	semantic errors	1	semantic errors	7
	parts of speech	0	parts of speech	1
Others[1/10]	Simple omission	0	Simple omission	1
	Awkward expressions	0	Awkward expressions	1

All the errors identified in Subject (S4)'s oral and written productions are categorized in Table 5, followed by Table 5-1 showing the number of errors in each category. She made many errors in determiners (mostly articles) and prepositions. Errors in S-V agreement and semantic errors are also found.

TABLE 5
Errors in S4's Productions

error type & example	
oral	written
<i>A. Morphology</i> (not found)	<i>A. Morphology</i> (not found)
<i>B. Syntax</i> 1. NP (1) determiners a. definite articles - My favorite place is __ snack bar. - My hobbies are sleeping, eating, and playing <u>the</u> bowling. b. possessives - I graduated from Jeong Eui <u>women</u> high	<i>B. Syntax</i> 1. NP (1) determiners a. substitution of definite article for possessive - <u>The</u> high school life was <u>nothing</u> special. (My) b. use of definite/indefinite articles - In <u>the</u> high school, my favorite place is t the snack bar because I was interested in some foods. (in high school)

school in 1999.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My hobbies are eating, playing <u>the bowling</u>, watching <u>the movie</u> and talking with friends. (...playing bowling, watching a movie...) - They help me to achieve <u>a</u> real happiness of life.
	(the)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <u> </u> Bowling game is very active. - I don't know what to be in <u> </u> far future. - But, I have a plan in <u> </u> near future. - We talk about many things, example <u>boyfriend</u>, <u>movie</u>, <u>drama</u>, etc.
	c. possessives
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I graduated from Jeong Eui <u>women</u> high school in 1999.
	(2) number
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - After 2 year ... (In two years)
(2) NP/subj. omission	(3) NP/subj. omission
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My family consist of four <u> </u>. (people) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My favorite movie types are romantic, comic <u> </u>. (movies) - My family consist of four <u> </u>. (people)
2. VP	2. VP
(1) tense	(1) tense
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My favorite place is snack bar. (was) - I'm playing the bowling with my boyfriend. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My favorite place <u>is</u> the snack bar because I was interested in some foods.
(play)	(2) S-V agreement
(2) S-V agreement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My parents <u>is</u> very gentle. - My family <u>consist</u> of four. - ... so he <u>work</u> very hard. - My boyfriend <u>like</u> to play it, too.
(3) verb usage	3. Prepositions
a. Vt (mis-selection of the complete)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My birthday is <u>17 Sept. in 1980</u>. - I got up in the morning everyday because I had to go to the school <u>until</u> 7:30. (by) - My brother is a Korea army... - We talk about many things, <u>example</u> boyfriend, movie, drama, etc.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sometimes my brother said "Oh, sister, I'm very tired. I <u>miss go home</u>." (miss going home/miss home) - My parents help me <u>for life better</u>. (... help me make my life better.) 	

<p>3. Prepositions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My birthday is 17 Sept. <u>in</u> 1980. - My younger brother is <u>_</u> Korean army. - I will obtain point 700 or more <u>at</u> TOEIC. <p>(I will obtain a score of 700 or more <u>on my</u> TOEIC exam.)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - But, I have a plan <u>in</u> near future. (for) - <u>After 2 year</u> I hope that I will be a copywriter. (In 2 years/Two years from now) - I got up in the morning everyday because I had to go to the school until 7:30 <u>as same as</u> the other students. (just like) - I will obtain point 700 or over <u>at</u> TOEIC exam. (on the/my TOEIC exam) - I <u>think</u> what will I be after 10 years. (think about) <p>4. Conjunctions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My favorite movie types are romantic, <u>___</u> comic. (and) <p>5. Word order</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I think what <u>will I</u> be... (I will)
<p><i>C. Others</i></p> <p>2. Vocabulary</p> <p>(1) semantic errors</p> <p>a. mis-selection of vocabulary</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I will obtain point 700 or more at TOEIC. (I will obtain <u>a score of 700</u> or more on my TOEIC exam.) 	<p><i>C. Others</i></p> <p>1. Simple omission</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I got up <u>___</u> in the morning everyday because I had to go to the school until 7:30 as same as the other students. (early) <p>2. Vocabulary</p> <p>(1) semantic errors</p> <p>a. mis-selection of vocabulary</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Perhaps <u>almost</u> people will like it. (most) - I will obtain point 700 or ... (a score of 700) - ... <u>over</u> at TOEIC exam. (.more...) <p>b. overextension of the meaning</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It (Kimchijige) <u>is</u> very good taste. (has) <p>3. Awkward expressions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - My favorite movie types are romantic, comic. (types/kinds of movies)

TABLE 5-1
The Number of Errors

Linguistic category	Oral	No.	Written	No.
Morphology [0/0]		0		0
Syntax [13/28]	NP:		NP:	
	determiners	3	determiners	9
	number	0	number	1
	NP/subj. omission	1	NP/subj. omission	2
	Prepositions	3	Prepositions	9
	VP:		VP:	
	tense	2	tense	1
	S-V agreement	2	S-V agreement	4
	verb usage	2	verb usage	0
	Conjunctions	0	Conjunctions	1
	Word order	0	Word order	1
Others[1/6]	Simple omission	0	Simple omission	1
	Vocabulary:		Vocabulary:	
	semantic errors	1	semantic errors	4
	Awkward expressions	0	Awkward expressions	1

From the data provided above, it is concluded that the subjects have difficulties in using articles, prepositions, morphemes (e.g., plural marker -s, S-V agreement) and vocabulary. The results are discussed in the next section in detail.

V. DISCUSSIONS

This section compares the four subjects' oral productions with their written productions in terms of the length, the contents and styles, and error types and frequency.

1. Length

Table 6 compares the length of two different kinds of corpora (i.e., speech and composition). The lines of each subject's oral and written productions counted based on 10 point font (for the whole productions, see Appendix).

TABLE 6
Number of Lines in the Oral and Written Productions

Subject	Oral productions	Written productions
S1	13	16
S2	7	7
S3	6	9
S4	11	19
	37 (lines)	51 (lines)

While only one subject (S2) produced the same length, the rest three subjects' written productions were longer than their oral productions. Particularly, S4's written production was 8 lines more than her oral production, and S1 and S3 produced 3 more lines. During the oral presentation, S4 showed language anxiety and omitted many parts of the last sub-topic assigned by the instructor (i.e. "You in 10 years"). Compared with their written work, not a single subject made longer oral presentation.

Based on the result, it is concluded that (i) EFL learners do not feel comfortable in speaking L2 presumably because of anxiety and time pressure whereas they feel more comfortable in writing task, which results in longer written productions: and (ii) Their speaking heavily relies on their writing. That is, they are reluctant to speak unless they are prepared in written forms. Therefore, it implies that EFL learners have more difficulties in speaking than in writing, and so it will be more effective if teaching writing precedes teaching speaking. When they can write, they are expected to speak confidently.

2. Contents and Styles

Their speech and composition corpora were very similar in styles as well as the contents. A colloquial style is somewhat different from a literary style (e.g., vocabulary selection, the length of the sentences, use of contraction). However, the learners do not seem to be aware of the fact that they should be different. As already stated in the previous section, when they made oral presentations, they basically depended on their written work that was done in advance. It seems to be hard for low-intermediate students to make an instant oral presentation/speech. In light of my teaching experiences for many years, many of the students prefer to have 'preparation time' in the classroom conversations. In many cases, they are very reluctant to speak when they are not prepared. They feel comfortable when they speak based on their writing. In the similar context, students prefer to have wait-time¹⁰⁾ before they speak in class. Many studies (e.g., Lee, 2003) have already shown that giving appropriate wait-time/pause before having them answer questions is an effective way of letting them have self-confidence and increasing their class participation.

3. Error Types and Frequency

There are not many differences between the oral and written productions in terms of error types and frequency. In relation to error frequency, young adult low-intermediate Korean EFL learners frequently make errors in determiners (mostly, indefinite articles), use of vocabulary (mostly, semantic errors), and prepositions. As indicated in Table 7, the frequency order does not show a significant difference between the speech corpus and the composition corpus.

¹⁰⁾ The length of time the teacher waits after asking a question before getting an answer from the students

TABLE 7
Error Frequency Order

FO	Error type	NEO	FO	Error type	NEW
1	determiners	6(17.6%)	1	determiners	15(19.5%)
2	vocabulary	5(14.8%)	2	vocabulary	14(18.1%)
2	prepositions	5(14.8%)	3	prepositions	13(16.9%)
4	number	3(8.8%)	4	NP/subj. omission	6(7.8%)
4	tense	3(8.8%)	5	tense	4(5.2%)
4	S-V agreement	3(8.8%)	5	S-V agreement	4(5.2%)
4	NP/subj. omission	3(8.8%)	7	word order	3(3.9%)
8	verb usage	2(6%)	8	number	2(2.6%)
9	nominalization	1(2.9%)	8	awkward expressions	2(2.6%)
9	simple omission	1(2.9%)	8	verb usage	2(2.6%)
9	article incorrect	1(2.9%)	8	conjunction	2(2.6%)
9	verb omission	1(2.9%)	8	nominalization	2(2.6%)
13	awkward expressions	0(0%)	8	verb omission	2(2.6%)
13	word order	0(0%)	8	verb addition	2(2.6%)
13	conjunction	0(0%)	8	simple omission	2(2.6%)
13	pronouns	0(0%)	16	article incorrect	1(1.3%)
13	verb addition	0(0%)	16	pronouns	1(1.3%)
Total No.		34(100%)	Total No.		77(100%)

FO: Frequency order

NEO: Number of errors in the oral productions

NEW: Number of errors in the written productions

Since the subjects' written productions were much longer than their oral productions (see Table 6), it is predictable that the total number of errors in written productions is greater than that in oral productions. Nevertheless, it is remarkable that error rate in oral productions is higher than that in written productions in 'number (8.8% vs. 2.6%)', 'tense (8.8% vs. 5.2%)', and 'S-V agreement (8.8% vs. 5.2%)'. The grammatical rules for 'number' (e.g., attaching plural marker -s), 'tense' (e.g., attaching past tense marker -ed for regular verbs), and 'S-V agreement' (e.g., attaching 3rd

person singular -s) are comparatively simple and easy. As far as these linguistic categories are concerned, it is assumed that they know the comparatively simple grammatical rules but they have problems in correctly using them in oral presentations (i.e., performance errors) due to inattention, anxiety or time limit. In other words, students are more relaxed and have more time to think before they produce when writing, and therefore they seem to make less performance errors in writing tasks than in oral tasks.

Meanwhile, the error rates in determiners, vocabulary and prepositions were very high in both oral and written productions, which means the learners have difficulty in using them regardless of the type of productions (i.e., oral vs. written). Particularly, the data shows that the learners have a hard time coming up with appropriate words/expressions in context as well as putting them into practice in sentences. Learners with limited proficiency tend to make sentences through word-for-word translations (e.g., 'point 700' to refer to 'a score of 700'), which leads to wrong/awkward expression. As many researchers (Clark, 1994; Kim, 2004; Kim, 2005) have already noted, vocabulary teaching is very important in that misuse of vocabulary is likely to have a marked effect on comprehension.

IV. PEDAGOGICAL IMPLICATIONS

The difference in error rate between the speech (i.e., oral) and composition (i.e., written) corpus was the greatest in 'number (8.8% vs. 2.6%)' followed by 'tense (8.8% vs. 5.2%)', and 'S-V agreement (8.8% vs. 5.2%)'. It is assumed that the subjects make many performance errors in the grammars during oral productions because of inattention and/or time limit. For learners with limited proficiency, improvising an oral presentation/speech seems to be difficult. In many cases, they are very reluctant to speak when they are not prepared. Students prefer to have wait-time before they speak. Therefore, giving appropriate wait-time before having them answer questions/speak is an effective way of letting them have self-confidence and increasing their class participation. Meanwhile, one remarkable difference between the oral and written productions was the length; their written productions were much longer than

their oral productions (see Table 6). Not a single subject made longer oral presentations than their written work.

In general, when comparing the speech corpus with the composition corpus, there were not many differences between them in terms of contents, a style (i.e., colloquial vs. literary), vocabulary selection, and error types and frequency. Therefore, it is assumed that the proficiency in oral presentation of EFL learners at this learning stage (i.e., low-intermediate) heavily depends on how much/how well they are able to write. This result implies that EFL learners' writing and speaking skills are co-related, and therefore the teacher does not need to separate how to teach speaking from how to teach writing. Also, teaching writing before teaching speaking might be the shortcut to the improvement of their overall active/production skills because they have more opportunities to write in L2 than speak in L2 in the EFL context.

The present study investigates four college students' oral and written productions. Future research needs to be done with larger number of subjects in order to generalize the results of the current study. Also, it will be more effective if it is done based on more spontaneous speech corpus.

REFERENCES

- Clark, E. (1994). *The lexicon in acquisition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Corder, S. P. (1974). *Approximate systems and error analysis: Review of current issues and research*. Paper presented at the ACTFL Annual Meeting, Denver, Colorado.
- Kim, N. B. (2004). An collocational analysis of Korean high school English textbooks and suggestions for collocation instruction. *English Language & Literature Teaching*, 10(3), 41-66.
- Kim, N. B. (2005). The effects of a vocabulary instructional method on vocabulary learning strategy use and the affective domain: Focus on an analysis of students' survey responses. *English Language & Literature Teaching*, 11(3), 89-112.

- Kim, Y. H. (1997). *A study of errors and intelligibility of Korean college students' utterances*. Unpublished master's thesis. Kangwon University, Choonchon.
- Lee, E. H. (2003). Learning through scaffolded assistance during interaction in the EFL classroom: The teacher's role to make an effective learning environment. *Pan-Pacific Association of Applied Linguistics*, 7(2), 189-213.
- Shin, D. S. (2001). *On the effective English teaching for Korean L2 learners based on error analysis*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. Chongju University, Chongju.
- Shin, H. J. (2002). *Origins of errors in moderate level Korean learners of English through error analysis*. Unpublished master's thesis. Sookmyong Women's University, Seoul.
- Shin, S. Y. (2002). *A comparative analysis of features and errors appeared in writing*. Unpublished master's thesis. Sungshin Women's University, Seoul.

APPENDIX

Oral and Written Productions of the Four Subjects

► Subject 1 - oral

First of all, it's my pleasure to introduce myself. As you know, my name is Seung-min Park. I was born in Mia in Seoul. Now I live in Ssangmun. My favorite color is yellow because sometimes it looks hot and sometimes it looks mild and warm. So I love yellow color. I graduated from Soong-Duk elementary school, Ko-Myung middle school and Kyung-Bok high. Now, I go to Shin-heung college and I'm studying in English Interpretation as you also know. My family consists of 5. My parents carrying on a kindergarten, one older brother studying chinese in china, and one little sister is studying music. She is playing Keyboard. My family are all christian. I love my family. My hobbies are listening to music and rapping with bit-box. I like playing computer games like 'Tetris' and 'Starcraft'. This is three times that I tell you guys about my dream. I want to have a two professional job. One is for my money and the other is for my life. For my money, I want to be a international lawyer or a translator. For my life, I want to be a real MC. MC is hip-hop in slang. Okay. Thanks for listening my introduction. (13 lines)

▶ Subject 1 - written

First of all, I'm very happy to introduce myself. My name is Seung-min Park. Seung means 'victory' and Min means 'the people'. So my first name means 'leading the people'. I certain that I have very high passion about English. I wanna talk many things with you, but this is homework. I was graduated from Soong-Duk elementary school, Ko-Myung middle school and Kyung-Bok high. Now, I go to Shin-heung college as you know. My family consists of 5; parent both are working in a kindergarten, one elder brother majors in chinese in china, and one little sister, she's so cute. My hobbies are listening to music and playing computer games. Especially, I do like urban music like Hip-Hop and R&B. In computer games, I do like 'Tetris' and 'Starcraft'. I want to have two professional jobs. One is for the money and the other is for my life. For my money, I want to be a international lawyer or a translator. For my life I want to be a real MC that means rapper. I'll complete my own poem about my life that can make people's sympathies. It maybe too hard to have two jobs. But I will do my best. I have trusted my Lord with my whole life since I was in my mothers womb. And now I'm walking the stairway that the Lord gave me step by step. I always pray for my future. I think praying and effort is all that I can do for my future now. Okay. Anyway this is end of my introduction. Thanks. (16 lines)

▶ Subject 2 - oral

Hi. I'm Yongsuk Um, freshman in the department of english interpretation. I want to gain self confidence about English and get more familiar with the language. That's why I decided to choice this department. My family consists of 3; father, mother and me. I'm an only son. My hobby is play games online. I spend my evenings playing it. I'm an outgoing person and have a positive way of thinking. I graduated from Sanggye high school in 2002. Though I feel that I should study English earlier, I've been lay on that. Now I made up my mind to start learning English. I need your help desperately. Thank you. (7 lines)

▶ Subject 2 - written

Hi. I'm Yongsuk Um, freshman in the department of English interpretation. I want to gain self confidence about English and get more familiar with the language. That's why I decided to choice this department. My family consists of 3. I'm an only son. My hobby is play games online. I spend my evenings playing it. I'm an outgoing person and have a positive way of thinking. I graduated from Sanggye high school in 2002. Though I feel that I should study English earlier, I've been lay on that. Now I made up my mind to start learning English. I need your help desperately. Thank you. (7 lines)

▶ Subject 3 - oral

Let me introduce myself to you. My name is Kyongkyu Kim and I'm freshman of Shinheung College. I was born in Banghak-dong. My birthday is July 25th in 1985. There are three people in my family; father, mother, and me. I'm a christian. I'm trying to live as the Bible say. My hobbies are reading books, watching movie, and playing soccer. My favorite color is red. Because red is strong. My special abilities are sports and game. There is my vision in Shinheung college. I will try. (6 lines)

▶ Subject 3 - written

I am graduated from Kangbuk middle school in 2002 and Youngmun high school on the Sungbukgu in 2004. I admit into Shinheung university in 2004. I volunteer the English language interpreting class. There are three people in my family. My family is father, mother and me. Father is 50 old man, mother is 45 old woman, and I at age 20. My family are on very friendly terms. So I am happy. I do reading books in large part. My hobbies are reading books, playing soccer and watch movies. My favorite computer game is Starcraft, and color is red because red is strongly sensation give me. My dream is humdrum life. First of all, go to army as a petty officer, and then there raise the funds. Therefore I set up a shop to PC room. This is naivety my dream. (9 lines)

▶ Subject 4 - oral

Let me introduce myself. My name is Sukhee Lee. I was born in Uijeongbu. I live in Seoul. My birthday is 17 Sept. in 1980. I graduated from Jeong Eui women high school in 1999. My highschool life was nothing special. My favorite place is snack bar. Ddukboki, Ramen, Udong, snacks and ice cream. I like them. I used to talk with my friend in there. Sometimes, I miss those days. My family consist of four; my father, my mother, younger brother and me. My parents is generous. My younger brother is Korean army. Sometimes my brother said "Oh, Sukhee, I'm very tired. I miss go home." So, very cute. My parents help me for life better. I love them. My hobbies are sleeping, eating, and playing the bowling. I'm playing the bowling with my boyfriend once a week. I watched the movie, "Tegukki huinallimyu". I'd like to study very hard and I will obtain point 700 or more at TOEIC. (11 lines)

▶ Subject 4 - written

Let me introduce myself. My name is Sukhee Lee. I was born in Uijongbu, Kyungki-do. My birthday is 17 Sept. in 1980. I graduated from Jeong Eui women high school in 1999. The high school life was nothing special. I got up in the morning everyday, because I had to go to the school until 7:30 as same as the other students. So, I was tired then. In the high school My favorite place is the snack bar because I was interested in some foods;

Ddukboki, Kimbab, Udong, snacks and ice cream. I also liked to talk with my friend in there. I miss those days. My family consist of four; father, mother, younger brother and me. My parents is very gentle. My brother is a Korea army, so he work very hard. They help me to achieve a real happiness of life. I love them. I hope that my family is happy together forever. My hobbies are eating, playing the bowling, watching the movie and talking with my friends. My favorite food is Kimchi-jige. It is very good taste. Perhaps almost people will like it. Bowling game is very active. My boyfriends like to play it, too. We play it together once a week. My favorite movie types are romantic, comic(anything) movies. I watched "Tegukki huinallimyu". Last, I like to talk with my friends. In any place, we talk about many things, example boyfriend, movie, drama, etc. I don't know what to be in far future. but I have a plan in near future. Now I would like to study English hard, and I will obtain point 700 or over at TOEIC exam. After 2 year I hope that I will be a copywriter. I think what will I be after 10 years. Perhaps I will be professional as a copywriter. (19 lines)

Examples in: English**Applicable Languages: English****Applicable Levels: College**

Eunha Lee
Department of English Interpretation
Shinheung College
117 Howon-dong, Uljongbu, Kyonggi-do, Korea
Tel: (031) 870-3620
Email: milky0321@nate.com

Received in April, 2006

Reviewed in May, 2006

Revised version received in June, 2006